Course Name: 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'
Professor Name: Prof. Malhar Arvind Kulkarni
Department Name: Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS)
Institute Name: IIT Bombay
Week:02
Lecture:06

Welcome back to this course called 'Introduction to Pāṇinian grammar'. So, far we have studied the name of the text which is the core in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition, we have also studied the linguistic background of Pāṇinian grammar, the names of 10 grammarians referred to by Pāṇini in his own grammar, we also studied various scholars and their contributions in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition itself; we studied this tradition up to this modern day, we also took a look at the non Pāṇinian grammatical traditions that exist in India even today. So, this is a brief survey of the grammatical activity related to Sanskrit pre as well as post Pāṇini.

Now, in this lecture today we shall look at certain other aspects related to the continuation of the tradition of Pāṇinian grammar till today, namely, the oral tradition and the teaching and learning of Pāṇinian grammar through the ages. We will take a few methods as samples for our study. I welcome you to this lecture in which first we shall go study the oral tradition, oral tradition of Pāṇinian grammar.

The text of the Aṣṭādhyāyī was part of the Vedic lore that needs to be memorized and that was memorized and was handed down from one generation to the next for a period of more than 2500 years in continuum. Pāṇini's grammar, the text of Aṣṭādhyāyī is considered as one of the six 'Vedāṅgas', the limbs of veda. Vyākaraṇa referring to the Pāṇinian Vyākaraṇa is stated to be the main of the six 'Vedāṅgas', "mukham vyākaraṇam smṛtam ". So, Vyākaraṇa is considered to be the 'mukha' the main, the head amongst the six, that was the status given to Vyākaraṇa and therefore, it was obvious that as a part of the 'Vedāṅga', as a part of the Vedic lore, it was memorized by the vedic scholars. And when the vedic scholars, they impart their knowledge of a particular recension of a veda, they also impart knowledge of the 'Vedāṅgas' and thereby the knowledge of Pāṇinian grammar. This is how Pāṇinian grammar became part of the oral tradition of the veda which has survived even today.

So, Pāṇinian grammar Aṣṭādhyāyī became part of the popular concept of 'daśagrantha', it was part of this wherein if not the entire text in a concession manner at least two adhyāyas or two chapters they are required to be memorized and this is still a very basic kind of curriculum for memorization. The complete text needs to be memorized, but at least two chapters, they are must. This is what I have seen personally in Pune not so long ago. That is why I am reporting this to you.

One important feature of this oral tradition of Aṣṭādhyāyī can be said to be the fact that the text of Aṣṭādhyāyī as we have received today through this oral tradition is a unique confluence of both vedic as well as non-vedic tradition. This is a very very important feature.

What do we mean by this? What we mean here is that some of the sūtras that we see in the text of the Aṣṭādhyāyī today are or were inserted or modified into the text by a commentary text called the Kāśikāvṛtti which was composed around 7th century CE and the later Pāṇinian grammatical tradition ascribes clearly these changes in the text of the Aṣṭādhyāyī to the authors of the Kāśikāvṛtti.

Here is one example provided on the slide 1.1.17 and 1.1.18, they are received as one sūtra as far as the VyākaraṇaMahābhāṣya is concerned which actually treats them as one sūtra, but the VyākaraṇaMahābhāṣya while interpreting this one sūtra proposes to make two parts of it and account for certain usage in this particular manner. Probably, this suggestion of the VyākaraṇaMahābhāṣya was taken too seriously by some later commentators and tradition and they actually split the one sūtra that the VyākaraṇaMahābhāṣya received into two and we find that they are separated as we find in the text of the Kāśikāvṛtti that is the next available text to us. So, the text of Kāśikāvṛtti presents these two as separate sūtras, VyākaraṇaMahābhāṣya received only one sūtra. So, this is a phenomenon that has happened over a period of time in this particular tradition of Pāṇinian grammar which was part of the oral tradition and so, this becomes a very important feature.

The text of the Kāśikāvṛtti cannot be said to be a part of the oral tradition at all, in fact it can be said to be part of the written transmission, but we are not talking about the text of the Kāśikāvṛtti, we are talking about the sūtras that are found in the text of Aṣṭādhyāyī, but they are also commented upon by the text of the Kāśikāvṛtti and that is why the version of these sūtras as found in the text of the Kāśikāvṛtti becomes extremely valuable and extremely important.

And the point that I am making over here is that the version of the sūtras as found in the text of the Kāśikāvṛtti has found its way in the text of the Aṣṭādhyāyī that is part of the vedic lore and which was committed to memory and which has come down to us through generations, that is very very important culturally and also grammatically.

So, when you commit Aṣṭādhyāyī to memory there are certain techniques to remember the 4000 sūtras. You cannot memorize all the 4000 sūtras at one go. Even if you say that you have memorized all the 4000 sūtras, to remember them in the course of time is if not equal more difficult task.

So, to remember the sūtras at particular intervals regularly you need to develop certain techniques which the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition readily developed and in this slide, I have mentioned one such technique and let me describe that to you.

The technique is 'Puṣpikā' technique. 'Puṣpikā' is a statement uttered at the end of the recitation of each 'pāda', this is what is 'Puṣpikā'. So, at the end of each 'pāda', you will find the statement of a particular kind which is called as 'Puṣpikā', what it assumes is a unit, a unit consisting of 20 sūtras that that are being, that is being referred to in this 'Puṣpikā' statement.

So, for example, take the beginning of a unit of 20 sūtras, the first unit of 20 sūtras, take the beginning of it, then go to the next unit of 20 sūtras and take the beginning of the second unit of 20 sūtras and do it recursively until you come to the end of the sūtras and place all these beginnings of each unit of 20 sūtras side by side and make a sentence out of those beginning words or half words.

To put it simply in the form of an equation, we can say that the first sūtra, the beginning of the first unit of 20 sūtras, is the first sūtra, and then take the beginning of that first sūtra, then go to the next unit second unit of 20 sūtras. So, 21st sūtra would be the beginning of that unit. So, collect the beginning word of that 21st sūtra, place it aside the first sūtra.

Then go to the next unit and collect the beginning of the 41st sūtra and place it aside the 21st sūtra beginning word and keep doing this until you reach the end of the 'pāda', such a statement which consists of the beginning words of the first sūtra of each unit of 20 sūtras occurs invariably at the end of each and every 'pāda'. This statement is what is called as 'Puṣpikā'. The purpose of this statement is that it helps the reciter to remember the entire number of sūtras in a particular unit in a structural way.

So, I am referring to 19th sūtra of the first unit of 20, I am referring to 7th sūtra in the second unit of 20 and things of that kind. It is easier for a reciter to remember a unit of 20 sūtras and then number the sūtras inside the unit accordingly and remember the sūtra like this. So, this was one device developed by the reciters and here is an example for you.

So, at the end of the first 'pāda' of the first chapter, we find this particular sentence which is part of the first bullet and I have also colored the relevant parts of this sentence in different manner.

So, for example, the first word 'vṛdhi' is in red color, the second 'ādyantavad' is in blue, 'avyayībhāva' purple and 'pratyayasyaluk' is in green. So, there is a purpose behind this coloring scheme which will be clear in a moment. So, if we look at the next few bullets on this slide, you notice that the very first sūtra in this 'pāda' is 'vṛdhirādaic'. So, the first sūtra of the first unit of 20 consists of the word 'vṛdhir' at the beginning.

So, you pick this word and place it here, the second unit of 20 begins with 21. So, pick the first word of the sūtra 'ādyantavad' and place it next to the word 'vṛdhi' here. Then you go to the next unit of 20 sūtras which is 41 and then pick the first word in this 41st sūtra which is 'avyayībhāva' and place it next to 'ādyantavad'. Then you go to the next unit of 20 that is the sūtra number 61 which is 'pratyayasya lukślulupaḥ'.

So, get the first word of this sūtra and place it next to 'avyayībhāva' and now what remains after this 61 is only 15 sūtras. There are 75 sūtras in this 'pāda'. So, in this unit there are only 15 sūtras remaining after the third unit of 20. So, you mentioned 15 as a number because the unit of 20 is not complete. So, you just mention that there are 15 more, there is a unit of 15 sūtras including this 61.

So, this unit of 20 is not complete. So, you will get this situation in many 'pādas' and that situation has to be tackled in this particular manner. In this way the sentence 'vṛdhirādyantavadavyayībhāvaḥpratyayasyalukpañcadaśa' provides me an information about the number of sūtras in this particular 'pāda'. So, there are 3 units of 3 units of 20 sūtras; that means, 60 plus pañcadaśa that is 15. So, there are 75 sūtras in this particular 'pāda'.

And here are the beginnings of each unit 'vṛdhi', 'ādyantavad', 'avyayībhāvaḥ' and 'pratyayasya luk'. These are the beginnings of the respective units. The fourth unit is incomplete, but still we mentioned the beginning of it. Now, the point of mentioning all these words is to remember a unit of 20 through the beginning word of it. This sentence is called 'Puṣpikā' and this helps enormously as far as the memorization of the sūtras is concerned and also the transmission of those sūtras is concerned.

Here is another example. So, this is taken from the smallest of the 'pādas' which consists of only 38 sūtras; that means, there is only one unit in this second example which is complete with 20 sūtras and the second unit of 20 sūtras is not complete. There are only 18 sūtras in this second unit. So, this is how they are mentioned. The first sūtra in 2.2.1 is 'pūrvāparādharottaramekadeśinaikādhikaraṇe'.

So, you pick the first word over here 'pūrvāparādharottaram' and place it in the sentence over here, then of course, go to the next unit which is incomplete. There are no 20 sūtras over here, but pick up the first sūtra in this second unit which is 'tṛtīyāprabhṛtīnyanyatarasyām'. So, pick the first word 'tṛtīyāprabhṛtīni' and place it next to the 'pūrvāparādharottaram' word over here in this sentence and that is all and then also mention how many sūtras exist in this particular unit. Now, that number is 18. So, aṣṭādaśa.

So, this 'Puṣpikā' that is found at the end of 2.2 provides us with information about the number of sūtras that exist in this particular 'pāda' 2.2, okay! there is a unit of 20 and then there is a unit of 18 that begins with 'tṛtīyāprabhṛtīni'. So, the second unit of 20 is not complete, only 18 are enumerated. So, that number is mentioned and so, we say plus 18 that is how we say.

There is one more method which I would like to mention here. This method was invented by my teacher and he taught it to me. The name of my teacher who invented this and taught it to me is Paṇḍita Śrī. La. Aṭhalekara, S. L Aṭhalekara. He lived in Pune and this method consists of confining the unit of sūtras to a small number 5. So, consider only 5 sūtras as a unit. So, you do not bother yourself with the 'Puṣpikā' of this kind.

Confine yourself to a smaller unit of 5 sūtras and it is very easy for you to remember now the unit of 5 and and let those units be memorized. Since its a small number of sūtras making one unit, one can easily also play with these units by going back and forth. Similarly, one can go straight or one can also come back in the reverse order and once you master doing this with one unit of 5 sūtras you can apply it to the other unit of 5 sūtras and then you can keep doing this for the whole 'pāda' then for the whole 'adhyāya' and then you can also do this for the whole text of Aṣṭādhyāyī. You can recite it one way and then you can also recite it in the reverse order that is what makes this particular method very special.

So, to summarize, we have seen the oral aspect of transmission of Pāṇinian grammar. Primarily this grammar was handed down and is handed down orally as part of the vedic lore and the vedic reciters developed methods to remember the number of sūtras, so as not to lose any part of the text. We can also say that other scholars devised some other methods to memorize the sūtras effectively.

Having said that now let us move ahead and take some information about the teaching and learning of Pāṇinian grammar. We would like to focus on two particular methods which which are prevalent even today very strongly.

The first one is the 'Kaumudī' method in which teaching of the sūtras of Aṣṭādhyāyī is done through the teaching of the 'Kaumudī' texts, namely the 'Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntakaumudī' and its reductions which we shall see little later. So, in the 'Kaumudī' method the sūtras are rearranged according to particular themes. So, all sūtras in the Aṣṭādhyāyī on a particular theme which are scattered through various 'adhyāyas' are brought together in this method in one particular chapter named after that theme with a focus on derivation of words and sentences and intricate points of derivation are discussed threadbare.

For example, compound or 'samāsa' is a phenomenon which exists very productively in Sanskrit, but if you look at the Aṣṭādhyāyī, you will find that the treatment of 'samāsas' or compounds is scattered all over Aṣṭādhyāyī. So, in 2.1 and 2 compounds are prescribed, the conditions are stated and if they are fulfilled, the compound is prescribed this is done in 2.1 and 2.

The gender of the compound is mentioned in 2.4, number of the compound is mentioned again in 2.4, then the suffixes in the compound, they are discussed in 3.2, then the compound final suffix is described in 5.4, the compound accent is described in 6.2 and the compound internal operations are described in 6.3.

Now, all these sections in the 'Kaumudī' method are brought together under a big umbrella of compound as subsections and with their help the derivation of compound is taught. So, compound prescriptions of each type of compound will become sub sections and similarly other parts of the Aṣṭādhyāyī, they will become parts of the subsections.

This is how gathering together the information scattered all over Aṣṭādhyāyī makes the 'Kaumudī' method very unique detailed nuanced as far as the derivation process of a particular phenomenon is concerned in this case, the compound.

So, the features of this 'Kaumudī' method are focus on derivation of words, focus on intricate points of meaning and word derivation correspondence, consulting the authoritative texts of the 3 Munis. So, this particular method was very popular and is very popular for more than 400 years now in the traditional curriculum as well as for more than 200 years in the university education system.

The traditional exams test the skill on the basis of mastery of this text. The 'Kaumudī' text has become a hallmark of the study of Pāṇinian grammar this day. So, there are some redactions also available, because it is a huge text.

So, there is 'Madhyasiddhāntakaumudī' which was ah an abridged version of the 'Siddhāntakaumudī', then there is one more called 'Sārasiddhāntakaumudī, then there is one more 'Laghusiddhāntakaumudī' little bit more abridged and this was further abridged to 'Paramalaghusiddhāntakaumudī'. So, these are different redactions available of 'Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntakamudī' following the same method number of sūtras gets reduced.

However, it suffers from certain drawbacks. They are too much stress is laid on memorization of words and also their meanings and also the derivation when it is possible to do this using other means. Also one who memorizes the words and the meanings and the derivations, most of the times has no idea of the words continuing from one sūtra to the next. So, which word is continued in a particular sūtra probably one is lost about in this particular method.

There is another method which takes care care of these drawbacks and this is called 'Kāśikā' method. It follows the sequential ordering of sūtras in the text of the Aṣṭādhyāyī for the purpose of study. So, it refers to different sections while studying different sections of the same topic like compound. So, we will study the first adhāya first then the second in the sequence. So, we will study the compound section not as one unit, but as part of different sub chapters and chapters and when we go to those subsections, we will study them. Now, the feature is that knowledge of words continuing from previous sūtras is intact, because you see the sūtras in sequence and how the words get continued. So, there is no need to memorize the meaning of the sūtras suffice it to memorize only the sūtra. So, a student also can on their own make the meaning of the sūtras that is possible in this particular method.

But this method also suggests, also suffers from certain drawbacks and they are a student has to learn different sections related to a single theme at different times that much patience is required on the part of the student studying through this method. Therefore, several students may find no cohesive treatment available at one go as we have it in the Kaumudī method. Similarly, no current trends in the development of thought are available as are noted down in the Kaumudī method notably the Navya-nyāya technique, they may not be available in this particular method therefore, this particular method can be criticized by saying that this is caught up in the history and is not moving ahead. So, what do we do in such a scenario? In such a scenario a solution is provided in which we combine both these methods, a method called Puṁbaī.

This method is developed over past more than 20 years of teaching, wherein teaching of Pāṇinian grammar combining combining the features of both 'Kaumudī' method as well as 'Kāśikā' method is in progress. This particular method was practiced in two cities namely Mumbai and Pune and a combination of these two names of the two cities is also the name of this particular

method highlighting the combination of both the methods 'Kaumudī' and 'Kāśikā'. So, combination of their name is the name given to this particular method.

The features of this 'Pumbaī' method are focus on derivation which is extremely important together with the focus on the text of the Aṣṭadhyāyī. So, that you do not need to remember the meanings of the sūtras. You are able to know the continuation of the words and we also move along the time, taking note of the new developments like the Navya-Nyāya language. This particular method also has an important feature called 'Dhātupārāyaṇa' in which verbal forms are created using the sūtras and recited altogether.

To summarize, we can say that the tradition of Pāṇinian grammar is evolving in the course of time and most importantly this tradition thinks so it is a live force. New methods are being developed to improve upon the historical methods and their shortcomings. It absorbs the best in current times and continuous to flow. We should therefore, learn the core and the basic part of Pāṇinian grammar which we shall do in the next lecture.

Now, before closing let me recite for you the beginning of an important text called Kāśikāvṛtti over here as is our practice. At the end of each even lecture, we recite the beginning verse of a particular text within the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition. So, this verses is the following "Vṛttau bhāṣye tathā dhātunāmapārāyaṇādiṣu, viprakīrṇasya tantrasya kriyate sārasaṃgrahaḥ". I repeat "Vṛttau bhāṣye tathā dhātunāmapārāyaṇādiṣu, viprakīrṇasya tantrasya kriyate sārasaṃgrahaḥ" and lastly the 5 sūtras of today, these are from the third pāda of the first adhyāya and the 5 sūtras are 'Bhūvādayo dhātavaḥ', 'upadeśe'janunāsika it', 'halantyam', 'na vibhaktau tusmāḥ', 'ādirñiṭuḍavaḥ'. I repeat 'Bhūvādayo dhātavaḥ', 'upadeśe'janunāsika it', 'halantyam', 'na vibhaktau tusmāḥ', 'ādirñiṭuḍavaḥ'. Thank you for your attention.