Course Name: 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'
Professor Name: Prof. Malhar Arvind Kulkarni
Department Name: Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS)
Institute Name: IIT Bombay
Week:11
Lecture:54

Welcome. I welcome you all to this lecture in the course Introduction to Pāṇinian grammar. We, in this lecture, we will focus on the Paribhāṣā - sūtras also known as Meta rules in the system of Pāṇinian Grammar. So far amongst the 6 types of sūtras we have studied quite a lot of saṁjñāsūtras. saṁjñāsūtras is the first type amongst the 6 and we have studied the core saṁjñā technical terms which are of different types that Pāṇini uses in his grammar, in his system.

Today, we shall focus on the Paribhāṣā - sūtras. So, the first question is what is a Paribhāṣā? And Paribhāṣā is defined in this way 'parito bhāṣyate anayā' - overall systemic statement, a statement which explains how a system behaves; in short, a meta rule. They explain how the rules are to be interpreted. Some meta rules are directly stated by Pāṇini in his own sūtras. We have studied some of them and we shall be mentioning some of them as well.

Some are assumed by him and are made explicit by later commentators based on the statements of Pāṇini. The meta rules become one with the prescription rules namely vidhisūtras which we shall study in the next lecture. So, 'vidhivākya ekavākyatā-āpanna' so, they become one with the rules which prescribe some operation and then they become meaningful. Primarily there are 3 types of paribhāṣās, vācanika, jñāpakasiddha and nyāyasiddha.

Vācanika is a rule which is available through a vacana, a statement a statement of either Pāṇini or Kātyāyana or Patañjali, the 3 munis. Jñāpakasiddha is the type of paribasha rule which is established on account of a particular mention in the sūtra which would turn redundant if such a rule is not accepted. So, jñāpakasiddha is a paribhāṣā which is inferred from the mention of Pāṇini which assumes certain kind of rule to exist. Nyāyasiddha has got some varieties. Nyāyasiddha is a rule which is established in accordance with some commonly accepted practice in the mundane behaviour as well as in the scientific enquiry. This is nyāyasiddha. There are special texts devoted to the study of paribhāṣās and here are mentioned a few, the foremost amongst them is Paribhāṣāvṛtti of Vyāḍi composed around 300 BCE which contains 93 paribhāṣās. There is Bṛhatparibhāṣāvṛtti composed by Sīradeva written in around 12th Century CE and it studies 130 paribhāṣās. Laghuparibhāṣāvṛtti by Puruṣottamadeva 13th century CE which studies 120 paribhāṣās. Then Paribhāṣāvṛtti of Nīlakaṇṭhadīkṣita who lived in 17th century CE, this text studies 140 paribhāṣās. And the most important text which is part of the current curriculum as well is Paribhāṣenduśekhara composed by Nāgeśa in the 18th century CE and this text studies 133 paribhāṣās. There are several commentaries that are written on this text called

Paribhāṣenduśekhara which are still studied in modern days. So, so much literature is devoted to explaining the paribhāṣās that underlies the importance of the paribhāṣās and paribhāṣā-sūtras.

So, we have so far studied some of the paribhāṣās, they were all vācanika paribhāṣās. Let us take a recap of the paribhāṣāssūtra that we have studied so far. For example, meaning of the 5th case we have already studied which is immediately after and the sūtra 1.1.67 which explains the meaning is 'tasmadittyuttarasya'. This is a paribhāṣāsūtra. We have also seen the meaning of the 7th case in the meta language of Pāṇini which is immediately before and the sūtra which states this is 'tasminniti nirdiṣṭe purvasya' 1.1.66. Then the meaning of the 6th case is in place of or instead of in the meta language of Pāṇini. This is stated by the sūtra 'ṣaṣṭhī sthāneyogā' 1.1.49.

So, these 3 sūtras these are paribhāṣāsūtras explicitly stated by Pāṇini in his Aṣṭādhyāyī. So, these 3 sūtras interpret the cases in the meta-language of Pāṇinian grammar which is different than how they denote the meaning in the object language. And, that is why they become extremely important, these are the paribhāṣāssūtra that we have already studied. The other fundamental principles that we have studied is that the word form is part of the meaning of the word. In fact, it is the main meaning in the meta-language.

This we have already seen when we looked at the difference between the object language and the meta-language in the Pāṇinian grammar and this is stated by the sūtra 1.1.68 'svamrūpaṁ śabdasyāśabdasaṁjñā' 1.1.68. These are the 4 sūtras that we have already studied. These are all paribhāṣāsūtra. Apart from them let us try to steady some other paribhāṣā. Here is the core paribhāṣā. This is not stated in the Aṣṭādhyāyī.

That paribhāṣā is 'sthāne ādeśaḥ nimitteṣu nimittebhyaḥ'. What it means is a substitute comes in place of a substituent in the environment of conditions before and after immediately, immediately before and immediately after. So, to show this in the equation form we can say the following if a plus b plus c, this is the given situation where b occurs immediately before c and immediately after a and then d substitutes b in this case. So, b is substituted by d in the environment of a before and c after. So, this is the primary function, this is the primary operation as far as Pāṇinian grammatical description is concerned. So, a and c they are considered to be nimittas, conditions, environments; b is considered to be the sthān or sthanī and d is considered to be ādeśa. The primary location of this act of substitution is cognitive apparatus of the speaker as well as the hearer in the process of communication. This is the core paribhāṣā.

So, 'sthāne ādeśaḥ nimitteṣu nimittebhyaḥ', so applying this particular paribhāṣā, we can say that if we have on the left hand side the sentence meaning and on the right hand side the sentence, the sentence meaning is made up of a few word meanings. Each word meaning is made up of

prakṛtyartha and pratyayārtha and correspondingly we have a sentence. So, the first bullet on both sides left as well as right represents a generic very general idea as far as very general stage in the process of derivation as far as the arthākaśa is concerned on the left hand side and the śabdākāśa is concerned on the right hand side and there is a correspondence between these two. Just as we have prakṛtyrtha and pratyayārtha etcetera, similarly we have prakṛti and pratyaya on the right hand side in the śabdākāśa.

These are shown in green primarily to refer to the fact that these are still very general stages as far as the derivation is concerned and now, they will get replaced primarily. So, the first prakṛti gets replaced by the actual specific gam and then the pratyaya slot; the pratyaya slot in the first pada gets replaced by ti. And, similarly, the second pada prakṛti and pratyaya slots which are generic they will get substituted by the respective prātipadika and pratyaya su and prātipadika and pratyaya. So, now, here we have the respective prātipadika and pratyaya su and prātipadika and pratyaya. So, now here we have dhātu plus pratyaya plus prātipadika plus pratyaya plus prātipadika and pratyaya this kind of format. This is the specific format which has substituted the generic format. So, the green colour indicates the generic format which gets substituted by the specific one which is indicated in the blue colours.

And, so, we have gam ti and then a comes in gam plus a plus ti plus Rāma plus s plus gramam and then gam gets substituted by gacch in the environment of a and then s gets substituted by ḥ in the environment of this pada. And then we have this gacch becoming gaccha , gacch gets substituted by gaccha and then we have the word gacchati Rāmaḥ grāmam. And then in the environment of g this ḥ which becomes o so, we have gacchati Rāmo grāmam.

So, this is how in the environments substitutions take place. The original slot is of this kind which is of very generic nature which is then filled in by prakṛti and pratyaya still general sāmanya and then we fill in these slots by the viśeṣa gam and ti and so on and so forth. And, these slots can be replaced by others as well. Instead of gam you can also put dṛś, you can also put sthā, dā etcetera etcetera; instead of ti you can put anti and so on and so forth. So, these slots can be filled in by various elements and then you get these basic elements and then you start processing and further substituting an element in the environment of another element. So, here is nimitta a which causes gacch to be substituted in place of gam. This can be described in different ways. For example, Pāṇini can say that this m is replaced by cch, but we see that this gam gets replaced by gaccha. This entire process gets replaced by this process, the entire stage gets replaced by another stage. Then this cha gets replaced by cch, this entire step is replaced by this entire step and finally, we get gacchati Rāmo grāmam as the derived generated sentence in the end from the very generic.

One of the other issues that we have studied is the process of speech production in which we studied the properties of each and every sound described in the Pāṇinian grammar, in the alphabet

and then we noted down those properties. And, here is a paribhāṣā stated by Pāṇini himself which utilizes these phonetic properties in the process of substitution using those properties to select the closest substitute. The sūtra is 'sthāne antaratamaḥ' 1.1.50. What it means is in place of a substituent is place the commonest or the closest substitute. Phonetic properties are formulated as the basis of substitution of verbal elements. This we have seen. For example, 'iko yaṇ aci' 6.1.77 says that yaṇ substitutes ik immediately before ac. The example is dadhi plus atra, i is the substituent and y v r l are the 4 substitutes stated by 6.1.77 in the environment of 'a' coming immediately after. So, immediately before a, i is occurring and so, we have 4 substitutes stated by the sūtra 6.1.77 which can come in place of 'i'. Now, 1.1.50 will clarify that amongst these 4 only the one which is the closest to 'i' in terms of the place of articulation namely 'y' in this case replaces the substituent and we get dadhy and atra. In place of dadhi the next stage comes is dadhy and atra.

The next part of this is another paribhāṣā stated in the Mahābhāṣya on the same sūtra and this reads 'yatra anekavidham āntaryaṁ tatra sthānataḥ āntaryaṁ balīyaḥ'. What this means is where the commonality is manifold between a substituent and possible substitute, the commonality of the place of articulation is considered stronger. For example, when we have a stage ci plus tṛ 7.3.84 prescribes 'i' in ci to be replaced by guṇa namely 'a' 'e' and 'o'. Guṇa is the technical term which means 'a' and 'e' and 'o'. So, now here we have a substituent 'i' whose place of articulation is tālu and here we have 2 substitutes which are closer to this a whose place of articulation is kaṇṭha and whose pramāṇa is short this is the short vowel and 'e' has the place of articulation tālu. In fact, it has 2 places of articulation 'edautoḥ kaṇṭhatālu' and also it is a long one.

Now, amongst these two 'a' and 'e', the place of articulation of 'e' matches with 'i' even though shortness is the property which also matches with 'a', but the place of articulation becomes stronger and therefore, 'e' replaces 'i' in this environment. So, the above meta rule says that the proximity in terms of the place of articulation is stronger, so 'i' is to be replaced by 'e' and so, we get ce plus tṛ and then we get cetṛ or ceta.

This is an extremely important principle which suggests the phonetic base once again for the process of substitution. Another important set of rules sandhi rules are the ones which talk about the place of substitution. So, where do we do the substitution? What is the location? So, suppose we have a substituent which has 4 parts a b c and d and the substitute which has either one part namely p or which has multiple many parts p q and r.

So, the question is where should the substitute be placed? In which part of the substituent? Should it replace the entire substituent a b c d or just one part of the substituent? If so, if just one part is to be replaced, then which part? Should it be the last one or the initial one or the middle one? Which one? These questions arise and they are answered by 4 sūtras in the Aṣṭādhyāyī.

'Alo'ntyasya' 1.1.52, ādeḥ parasya 1.1.54, anekāl śit sarvasya 1.1.55 and ṅicca 1.1.53. ṅicca 1.1.53 is placed last and not after 52 which is for some specific reason which we shall make clear in the course of time in this lecture. Let us study all these sūtras now.

The first one is 'Alo'ntyasya', what it literally means is in place of a final sound, 'al' is a sound antya is the final. What it means is a substitute replaces the final element of the substituent. So, suppose we have a b c and d as substituent, then a substitute replaces only d that is the meaning of this rule and this is considered as a by default rule wherever other rules do not apply this rule applies.

For example, we have a sūtra 'tyadādīnām aḥ' 7.2.101 which says that in the environment of a vibhakti, 'a' is the substitute which comes in place of yad etcetera yad tad yad. So, suppose we have yad plus s, s is a vibhakti and now, this 7.2.101 applies and says that substitute this yad by a. Once again the same question should this a replace the entire yad or d or y or a which one?

And, the answer provided by 1.1.52 is that this substitute replaces only the final element. In this case only d gets replaced by 'a' and so, from yad plus s, we get ya, a, s. This a is in coming in place of d. So, we have ya a s and then there is this other rule gate which comes in and joins both these together and so, we have ya plus s and then finally, we have yaḥ. This is how 'alo'ntyasya' functions. This is a by default rule.

The next rule is 'ādeḥ parasya'. What it means is a substitute replaces the initial part of the element when substitution is stated in place of an element which is stated immediately after another element. So, clearly this is an exception to 1.1.52. So, for example: if you have x y and z part of one unit plus a b c d part of another unit, in this situation if a substitute stated to replace a b c d which comes immediately after x y z, this is also stated in the rule. That means, x y z is made a condition for the substitution of a b c d then the substitute replaces the initial part of the substituent a b c d which is a. a becomes the substituent.

And, here is an example 'īdāsaḥ' 7.2.83. What this sūtra means is it has got two words īd and āsaḥ. īd is 1/1, āsaḥ is 5/1, ānasya continues 6/1 from the previous rule. So, what this means is substitute īd that is long ī in place of āna when it comes immediately after the verbal root ās . So, we have ās plus āna, ās is the condition for this substitution. So, when āna comes immediately after ās substitute this an by ī.

Now, this sūtra says that in such a case substitute ā by ī the initial element of substituent ān that is ā that gets substituted by ī. So, we have ās plus āna gets substituted by ās plus īn, we join it and we get the word āsīna which means one who sits. We have the word udāsīna which means one who sits on top. This is the second sūtra which clarifies the position of the substitution.

Next we have another exception to the by default rule namely 'anekāl śit sarvasya' 1.1.55. What it means is a substitute replaces the entire substituent. 1.1.52 replaces the final element, 1.1.54 replaces the initial element and now 1.1.55 is replacing the entire substituent. If there are 2 conditions if one the substitute is formed with more than one sounds it should be anekāl and 2 the substitute is formed by one sound ok, but with a marker ś śit. This is an exception to 1.1.52. So, the entire substituent is replaced by a substitute.

So, for example, if you have a b c d as the substituent and p q r as the substitute, then because p q r consists of 3 sounds more than one so, p q r replaces the entire a b c d that is one and the second situation is if a b c d is the substituent and p only one sound is the substitute, but with a marker ś 'it' is śit then this p with marker ś replaces the entire a b c d.

Let us look at the examples. The first one on the left hand side is the example where the substitute is anekāl and the second one is the example of the substitute being ekāl, but with the marker ś. So, in the situation as plus ta asterbhūḥ 2.4.52 applies which means immediately before the suffix ta, Substitute the verbal root as by bhū. bhū is formed with bh and ū. So, this is anekāl and so, it replaces the entire 'as', as simple as that. So, then we get bhū plus ta replacing as and so, we get the word bhūta.

Now, if we have the situation idam plus ha, the sūtra 'idama iś' 5.3.3 comes into play and this means immediately before the suffix ha substitute idam by iś. iś consists of only i which is a single sound, but with the marker ś added to it. So, this is śit. So, by application of 1.1.55 this i will replace the entire idam. And so, we get i plus ha namely iha as the final output.

And, now we come to 1.1.53 which is ṅicca which says that a substitute which is formed with more than one sounds that is anekāl, but has a as its marker then the substitute does not replace the entire substituent rather it replaces the final element of the substituent only the final element.

So, this is an exception of 1.1.55 which in it is turn is an exception of 1.1.52. Thus on the whole we can say that this rule brings back or reinforces the operations stated by 1.1.52. What it means is if a b c d is the substituent and if p q r which is anekal with the marker n is the substitute then p q r replaces the final element of the a b c d and not the entire a b c d as was the case with 1.1.55 and so, we get the output namely a b c p q r.

Here is an example. We have dadhi plus a 3 slash 1 and the rule 'asthi-dadhi-sakthyakṣṇām anaṅ udāttaḥ' applies over here 7.1.75. This sūtra means immediately before the vowel beginning suffixes in the third to 7th triplet group substitute asthi dadhi etcetera by an. an has 2 sounds, a and n. So, it would replace the entire dadhi by 1.1.55 because it is an anekāl. But, because the marker ṅ is added to it now it replaces only the final element of dadhi namely i because of 1.1.53. And so, we get dadhan in place of dadhi in the situation dadhi plus ā we get the dadhan plus ā and then a is dropped and we get dadhn ā and then finally, we get dadhnā as the finished form.

So, these are the 4 paribhāṣāsūtra which clarify the exact location of the substitution. 3 locations the final position of the substituent which is a by default position, the initial position which is an exception and then the entire substituent, these are the 3 positions stated.

Now, we have some sūtras which prescribe the augments and some sūtras which state the exact location, the place where this augment is to be added. There are 3 augments stated and 2 sūtras which are explained hereafter. The augments which have the marker ṭ and k are stated by 1.1.46 and augments which have the marker m is stated by the other sūtra. Let us look at them one by one. The first type is the one which states the place to add the augment. So, the location of the augment is the subject of this set of paribhāṣāsūtra and there are 2 sūtras here the first one is 'ādyantau ṭakitau'.

What this sūtra means is that the augment with the marker ṭ is made the initial part of the whole to which it is added and the argument with the marker k is made the final part of the whole to which it is added. Let us take the example 'ārdhadhātukasya iṭ valādeḥ' 7.2.35. What this means is that add an augment iṭ to an ārdhadhātuka suffix which begins with val. So, in the case of paṭh plus ta, ta is an ārdhadhātuka suffix which begins with val. So, iṭ is to be added to it. Now, this iṭ has ṭ as a marker.

So, it is made an initial part of the suffix ta. So, we get from paṭh plus ta here we get paṭh plus i-ta this i is added before and so, we get the form paṭhita. Similarly, we have the sūtra 'āne muk' 7.2.82 which says that immediately before āna add the augment muk which is m to an aṅga ending in short 'a'. So, we have pac, a plus āna. 'pac a' is an aṅga with reference to āna and this aṅga ends in short 'a' followed by the suffix āna. So, 7.2.82 applies and adds the augment 'm' to 'a' of the aṅga. So, we get 7.2.82 applying and so, we get 'pac a m', because this is kit. So, it is added here at the end by 'ādyantau ṭakitau' and so, we get the form pacamāna.

And, the second sūtra which talks about the place of the augment is midaco'ntyātparaḥ 1.1.47. It says an augment with marker m is added after the final vowel of an element. Here is an example. 'catur plus as' 1/3 and the sūtra is 'caturanaḍuhor ām udāttaḥ' the augment 'ā' is to be added to the words catur and anaḍuh immediately before the first 5 suffixes stated in 4.1.2 and so, we get catu.

Now, where do we add this ā and 1.1.47 says add it after the final vowel in catur which is this u. So, we add this ā after this u and so, now, we get 'catu ā r plus as' and so, then there is a sandhi. So, this u becomes v, 'catv ā ras' and so, we get catvāraḥ. Then there is a rule paribhāṣāsūtra related to accent which is 'anudāttaṁ padam ekavarjam' 6.1.158. What this means is excluding one the remaining pada gets anudātta accent. So, rājapuruṣa is an example where 'samāsasya' 6.1.223 makes the final vowel udātta this 'a' in 'ṣ' is udātta.

So, it is not marked by any symbol as far as the writing convention is concerned and so, the remaining vowels 'ā a u and u', all of them they become anudātta. The remaining vowels remain anudātta and are marked with a horizontal bar below the letter, as you can see over here all these 4 vowels are marked anudātta because of the paribhāṣā 'anudāttaṁ padam ekavarjam'.

Then we have an important paribhāṣā which deals with the padavidhi based operations and the paribhāṣāsūtra is 'samarthaḥ padavidhiḥ' 2.1.1 which means an operation which takes pada as an input is conditioned by samartha meaning having the same meaning and capable of expressing the same meaning. For example, compounding or samāsa takes pada as an input. So, compounding is condition by samartha. So, in a sentence if you use the words 'rājñaḥ puruṣo gacchati', a kings man goes. So, rājñaḥ puruṣo these 2 words are connected meaning wise. So, they can be compounded provided the compound expresses the same meaning samartha and the compound is capable of expressing the same meaning. So, rājapuruṣa is the compound made and now it expresses the same meaning a kings man goes. Therefore, there is this sāmarthya and any padavidhi for example, a compound requires samartha or sāmarthya as a necessary condition.

Then we have another important paribhāṣā 'yena vidhis tadantasya' 1.1.72 which means the element that acts as a qualifier is to be interpreted as the element ending in that element participating in the grammatical operation. For example, we have a sūtra 3.1.97 'aco yat' , acaḥ is 5/1, dhātoḥ is 5/1 and yat is 1/1. Now, acaḥ qualifies dhātoḥ. So, acaḥ is interpreted as 'ajantāt' that is a verbal route ending in a vowel. So, the overall meaning of the sūtra is add the suffix yat after a verbal root which ends in a vowel. And, so, we have the verbal root ci which ends in a vowel to which we add the suffix yat and then we get from 'ci plus yat' we get 'ce plus yat' and the final form 'ceya'.

To summarize, the meta rules are an integral part of the system of Pāṇinian grammar. We have studied these meta rules several types of meta rules. Different types of such meta rules carry out different functions in the system. The major grammatical operation is the substitution. The meta rules explain the phonetic basis of the process of substitution. The other meta rules explain the exact position of the substitution. And, sometimes even the augment rules are also considered to be part of the process of substitution. Even the augments are considered as substitutions; un-augmented form get substituted by an augmented form.

To end the lecture we recite the maṅgalācaraṇa taken from Paribhāṣāvṛtti of Nīlakaṇṭhadīkṣita which reads, "varadeśvarayajvānaṁ nīlakaṇṭhena yajvanā, namaskṛtya satāṁ prītyai śabdanyāyo vivicyate". I repeat, "varadeśvarayajvānaṁ nīlakaṇṭhena yajvanā, namaskṛtya satāṁ prītyai śabdanyāyo vivicyate" and the 5 sūtras taken from 7.3, 'devikā-śiṁśapā-dityavāḍ-dīrghasatra-śreyasāmāt', 'kekaya-mitrayu-pralayānāṁ yāderiyaḥ', 'na yvābhyāṁ padāntābhyāṁ pūrvau tu tābhyām aic', 'dvārādīnāṁ ca' and 'nyagrodhasya ca kevalasya'. I repeat, 'devikā-śiṁśapā-dityavāḍ-dīrghasatra-śreyasāmāt', 'kekaya-mitrayu-pralayānāṁ yāderiyaḥ', 'na yvābhyāṁ padāntābhyāṁ pūrvau tu tābhyām aic', 'dvārādīnāṁ ca' and 'nyagrodhasya ca kevalasya'.

Thank you. We shall study the next type of sūtra vidhisūtra in the next lecture. Thank you for your attention.