

**Course Name: 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'**  
**Professor Name: Prof. Malhar Arvind Kulkarni**  
**Department Name: Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS)**  
**Institute Name: IIT Bombay**  
**Week:08**  
**Lecture:38**

Welcome. I welcome you all to this lecture in the course Introduction to Pāṇinian grammar. We are studying the process of speech production and then in this process we studied the concept of noncompositionality and then we started studying the concept of Compositionality which is very fundamental to understanding the system of Pāṇinian grammar and that is why we started studying this concept. We said that the compositionality exists at 3 levels at the artha level, at the śabda level and also at the svara level in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition. Then we started studying the compositionality of artha and we introduced the concept of anvaya vyatireka. We also introduced the source namely the Vyākaraṇamahābhāṣya of Patañjali in which this concept is elaborately explained using peculiar examples. And so, we said that from this sentence meaning we derive the components. Then we also said that the exclusive sentence meaning is the meaning of the combination of these component meanings, that is what is exclusively the sentence meaning.

Now, in this lecture we shall study the meaning of these components of the sentence as described in the Vyākaraṇamahābhāṣya. So, we shall study the compositionality of artha mainly the padārthaḥ. So, the Vyākaraṇamahābhāṣya said that "padārthānām abhisambandhaḥ vākye bhavati" and then it concluded by saying that "tadeṣāṁ sāmānye vartamānānām viśeṣe avasthānaṁ vākyārthaḥ". So, when an individual padārthaḥ which is linked to the generic template of the other padārthaḥ which gets filled in by the combination of the padārthas and that is what makes the vākyārthaḥ. This is what we have studied so far.

Now, after studying this vākyārthas which is made up of padārthas WM1 plus WM2 and WM3 etcetera and we said that this plus is what is exclusively the sentence meaning. Let us now study what is WM1 and WM2 and WM3 made up of? what are its components? The same process of anvaya and vyatireka which was described in the Vyākaraṇamahābhāṣya earlier is applied to word meanings, namely the padārthas and also the words padas. Now, we will focus in this lecture on the word meanings namely the padārthas, we will focus on pada and vākyā later on.

Now, when we focus on padārthas we find that each word meaning padārtha is found composed of the following three elements. One is the meaning of the left hand side element also known as the root meaning, prakṛtyartha prakṛti artha prakṛti is the root artha is the meaning prakṛtyartha which is generally placed on the left hand side.

The second part is the meaning of the right hand side element also known as a suffix, suffix meaning namely pratyayārtha which is generally in almost all the cases placed on the right hand side. And then of course, the relation between the root meaning prakṛtyartha and suffix meaning namely pratyayārtha. This relation is also an important part of the word meaning just as it was an important part of the sentence meaning, it is also important as far as the word meaning is concerned as far as the padārtha is concerned.

Let us take the same example that we took earlier. The sentence that we took was grāmaṁ gacchati Rāmaḥ and we said that this is the result of the collected meaning namely Ram goes to a village. So, this one unit of sentence meaning is composed of three word meanings; they are WM1 which is to a village WM2 goes and WM3 Ram. Now, if we look at these word meanings we also find that by applying the same process of anvaya and vyatireka, we also find that these word meanings can be said to have been composed of its components; namely village and to. Goes can be said to have been composed of two components namely go and es and then Ram can be said to have been composed of by two components namely ram and 0.

So, these are now the components which make up the word meaning. padārtha is made up of the prakṛtyartha and pratyayārtha village is the prakṛtyartha, 'to' can be said to be the pratyayārtha, go is the prakṛtyartha and es seems to be the meaning of the pratyayārtha, es can be said to indicate the meaning of the pratyayārtha. Ram can be said to be the meaning of the prakṛti so, prakṛtyartha and 0 can be said to be the pratyayārtha in general.

So, now what we said about the sentence meaning is also true about the word meanings. Namely, that the word meaning is the collection of root meanings and suffix meanings. Plus sign in between the root and suffix meanings is the word meaning which is something additional over and above the meanings of the root and the suffix. This meaning indicated by the plus sign cannot be assigned to any particular verbal element and also the meanings assigned to these verbal elements. But, this is assigned to the combination of the root and the suffix, that is the reason why we call this an exclusive word meaning, padārtha the meaning of the plus sign.

Once again this additional meaning is always relational as is the case with the sentence meaning. What this means is that this meaning which is relational links two or more meanings of the verbal elements together. In this linkage there is also a head modifier relationship which is implicit not stated by any of the words, but stated only by the combination. It is the relational meaning which is regarded as the head of the unit and the respective root and suffix meanings are regarded as modifiers within the padārtha. The root and suffix meanings are also structured in a particular rule based manner. Now, within the root meaning and the suffix meaning also we will find some head modifier relationship which we will talk about later on.

Now, when we look at the word meanings, we have to say that one of the meanings has to be an action whose description involves other root meanings as parts of the action. Now, there could be some root meanings which can be linked to other root meanings that is other than action. So, these root meanings convey the meaning namely other than action. So, there will be a head modifier relationship between these non-action meanings as well, this is what is understood as far as the word meanings are concerned.

Let us now focus on the components of the word meanings padārtha namely pratyayārtha and the prakṛtyartha, pratyayārtha is the suffix meaning, let us try to see what this suffix meaning stands for? what is it that it is composed of? So, suffix meaning is generally considered to be the head of the padārtha as far as the contrast between the suffix meaning and the root meaning is concerned.

Now, in this scheme that we are following, the suffix meaning is denoted by a symbol a notation namely TM which is Termination Meaning. Generally, this termination meanings or the terminations generally the terminations explicitly express relations of the root meanings namely the prakṛtyartha. Generally, the termination meanings are the relations between the root meanings namely the prakṛtyartha. These relational meanings mainly link the verbal root namely dhātu with the nominal roots namely prātipadikas and obviously, their meanings. Sometimes, the relational meanings also link the meanings of the nominal roots as well. At least one word meaning that is padārtha is such where the suffix meaning namely the pratyayārtha is identical with the root meaning namely the prakṛtyartha.

So, the point is that the pratyayārtha links the meanings of the verbal root and the prātipadikas mainly. As we have seen earlier, it is the action which is considered to be the head in the sentence. A speaker wants to convey an action mainly in which several entities participate as participants which bring about the accomplishment of that particular action. And so, this occupies the main position as far as the word meaning is concerned. Similarly, there could be some other meanings also and we shall see what they are.

The relational meaning expressed by the suffix is different than the combinatorial meaning which is based on the combination of words. The difference we must understand. The point is that the sentence meaning is composed of the word meanings and here we are talking about the word meanings which is composed of the root meanings and the suffix meanings. So, the relational meaning which is expressed by the suffix which is part of the word meaning padārtha is not the same as the relational meaning expressed by padārtha which is part of the sentence meaning. This difference exists as far as the hierarchy is concerned and not the nature. So, we

can say that one can point to this verbal element namely a suffix and say that this suffix expresses this meaning. This is the difference which is not possible as far as the sentence meaning is concerned.

So, in sentence meaning you cannot point to a verbal element and say that this combinatorial meaning is the meaning of this particular element. But, when we talk about the relational meaning expressed by the pratyaya itself you can point out to the word and say that this relational meaning is expressed by this verbal element, namely the suffix.

Now, the point is that this suffix meaning acts as the head, although this is the head in the process this meaning comes later. And, the root meaning is decided first by the speaker when he collects the meaning as far as the stay is described as *ātmā buddhyā sametyārthān*. So, after having collected the root meaning first, the suffix meaning is then collected and attached which expresses the relation of that root meaning with the action or the other nominal meaning. If the root indicates an action, then it is connected to the other nominal meanings. But, if the root indicates or denotes the nominal meaning then the suffix attached to it expresses the relation of that root meaning with the action meaning.

The suffix meaning which links the root meanings with the action are technically termed as *kāraka*. So, one thing to be noted here is that *kāraka* is by nature a relation, relation of different entities with an action. This is part of the meaning, we have to be very clear about this terminological difference. we keep hearing that there are 8 *kāra*kas, there are 7 *kāraka*, people used to describe *kāraka* in this fashion.

We have to be very clear about this there are neither 8 *kāra*kas, nor 7 *kāra*kas. What people are referring to generally when they say this is what is also associated with the *kāraka* namely the *vibhakti* which we have seen earlier which we have studied earlier when we studied the concept of 'it'. So, there are 8 *vibhaktis* yes and *vibhaktis* is the feature of the sound or the word that is audible, *kāraka* is the feature of the meaning, *kāraka* is in fact, the meaning.

And what kind of meaning? Relational meaning which is the suffix meaning. So, this distinction has to be very very clear, *kāraka* is part of the meaning and the relational meaning at that. So, relation of different entities with an action is what is primarily the meaning of *kāraka*. We can say that roles that are played by different entities in the accomplishment of that particular action can be called *kāraka* in a way. We can also go further and say that the idea of the speaker about the role different entities can play with respect to the accomplishment of an action can be called as *kāraka*. But we shall study the concept of *kāraka* later on, we are just mentioning the clues which we shall develop later on in this course. This is what is the idea of *kāraka*.

There are 6 *kāraka* noted down by Pāṇini. They are *kartā karma karaṇa saṁpradāna apādāna* and *adhikaraṇa*. These are all very famous *kāra*kas. *Kāra*kas. So, we have to be very clear about the

number of as well. How many kārakas are there described in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition? If this question is asked the one and only answer to this question is 6. Please be careful about using these terms and the confusion that is generally caused. There are only 6 kārakas and kārakas are the relational meanings. They are not the words, they are not the features of the words, they are the meanings expressed by the words. So, kartā karma karaṇa saṁpradāna apādāna and adhikaraṇa, these are the meanings. We confuse them sometimes with the words, sometimes it is understood because of the brevity principle which works, sometimes we do this. But, we have to be clear that these kārakas, they are part of the meanings.

Now, if we look at the order in which they are defined by Pāṇini, we find that this order is different than what is presented above. And what is that order? apādāna saṁpradāna karaṇa adhikaraṇa karma and kartā, this is how Pāṇini states the kāraka apādāna is stated by 1.4.25, saṁpradāna is stated by 1.4.32, karaṇa is stated by 1.4.42, adhikaraṇa is stated by 1.4.45, karma is stated by 1.4.49 and kartā is stated by 1.4.54. This is how Pāṇini states them. What is the significance of this order? We shall study this facet when we look at the definition of all these kārakas in detail, later on in this course.

Apart from the kāraka the suffix meanings that we are describing just now also involve some other additional meanings namely the number. And, in Sanskrit there are three numbers; one, two and three, also associated as part of the relational meaning. Also gender three genders; masculine, feminine as well as neuter. They are also conveyed by the suffixes so are part of the suffix meanings and also the persons prathama. The term prathama is used in Sanskrit Pāṇinian grammar to indicate he, she and it, they in plural this is what is conveyed by the prathamuruṣa or the prathama first not first prathama person.

We refrain from translating prathama as something, we keep it as it is as a technical term and we shall study this further when we look at the saṁjñā in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition. Then comes madhyama person which is indicated by the pronoun you in singular and Y capital in plural and finally, uttama which indicates I capital and in plural we. This is also conveyed by the suffixes. So, they are part of the suffix meanings.

Also, the tense or the mood namely vartamāna or bhūta or ajñārtha as we shall see in the case of abhyāja. These are also conveyed by the suffix. Also there are relations like possessed, possessor which is svasvāmibhāva part and whole relation avayava-avayavibhāva and so on and so forth. They are also conveyed by the suffixes. So, they are also the suffix meanings. These suffix meanings are arrived at once again by applying the same procedure described in the Vyākaraṇamahābhāṣya notably the anvaya and the vyatireka.

Now, let us look at the root meaning; what after all constitutes the root meanings prakṛtyartha, the root meanings are classified into two broad categories; action and non-action. Action is known as kriyā or dhātvartha the meaning of the dhātu is the verbal root which we shall study later on. Then non-action meaning is known as namārtha or prātipadikārtha. We also study the concept of prātipadikārtha when we study the saṁjñā later on in the course. The non-action meaning includes the meanings of nouns, pronouns, adjectives, adverbs, indeclinables etcetera; everything other than the action comes under the umbrella of non-action meanings. These are typically the meanings of the roots. So, they are called prakṛtyartha.

prātipadikārtha includes the universal as well as an individual aspect of meaning as well as gender number etcetera. The prātipadikārtha is classified into two once again; compositional as well as non-compositional. The non-compositional prātipadikārtha is that meaning which cannot be shown to have components. The compositional prātipadikārtha is that meaning which can be shown to have components and these components once again could be action and non-action.

So, there is this recursive process in which the componential meanings can also be constructed. The verbal meaning can also have part of compositionality in which only the verbal meaning once again plays an important part of as component and the suffix meanings also act as the components. As far as the verbal meaning is concerned, the action meaning is concerned it can also be shown to be composed of the meanings which are non-action meanings and the suffix meanings.

So, in a nutshell the compositionality of the padārtha can be shown in this particular form of the equation followed by this specific example. So, the padārtha which is WM1 is composed of root meaning 1 plus termination meaning 1. Then the WM2 can be shown to be composed of root meaning 2 plus termination meaning 2 and the WM3 can be said to be composed of root meaning 3 and termination meaning 3. Now, this WM1 plus WM2 plus WM3 when combined can be said to express the SM 1 which is the sentence meaning. So, we take the example grāma plus karma, these are the meanings of the roots and suffixes. So, grāma is the root meaning 1, karma is the termination meaning 1 which constitutes 1 padārtha which in its turn constitutes the vākyārtha. gamana is the root meaning 2 and vartamāna kartā prathama and eka these are the termination meaning 2. When they are joined together they convey the WM2 which in its turn constitutes the sentence meaning. And finally, Rāma which is the root meaning 3 and there is 0, meaning as far as the termination meaning 3 is concerned that is it is identical with Rāma which we shall study later on. So, this is your termination meaning 3 which constitute the WM3, the word meaning 3 which in its turn constitutes the vākyārtha.

So, here the one sentence meaning which is composed in 3 word meanings which in their turn are composed of root meanings which are 3 in number and, termination meanings which are also 3 in number. This is how the sentence meaning can be shown to possess components. Similarly,

if we take another example which is taken also by the Vyākaraṇamahābhāṣya, we say that root meaning 1 plus termination meaning 1 constitute 1 word meaning which is WM1, root meaning 2 and termination meaning 2 constitute WM2 and so on, because here there are 4 words. So, we have an additional element called root meaning 4 and termination meaning 4.

So, Devadatta is that root meaning 1 followed by 0 termination meaning 1 followed by go which is the root meaning 2 and karma which is the termination meaning 2, they constitute 1 word meaning WM2; followed by abhyājana which is the root meaning 3, followed by ajñārtha which is the mood which is the termination meaning 3 plus kartā and madhyama and eka. All these are the termination meaning 3. So, they all constitute the WM3 showed by one bracket followed by the root meaning 4 which is śuklā and the termination meaning 4 namely karma and all these four, they constitute one sentence meaning and this continues. You can have more sentences and sentence meanings which can be analyzed in this fashion. Here we are focused on the sentence meanings which can be shown to possess the constituents in the form of padārtha which in their turn can be shown to possess the prakṛtyarthas and the pratyayārthas.

To summarize the discussion that we have done so far. We say that from the sentence meanings, the word meanings are extracted. From the word meanings, the root meanings and the suffix meanings are extracted. Root meanings and suffix meanings are the linguistic atoms as far as the meanings are concerned. The compositionality in the meaning gets reflected in corresponding word level as well as accent level; compositionality of words and compositionality of accents, śabda and svāra. The root meanings and suffix meanings are regarded as the base for generation of the process of speech. Reversing the process of extraction helps generation of the speech. In this process the status of the head also gets correspondingly reflected to the respective units. Just as the suffix meaning is considered as the head, the suffix will also be considered as the head at the śabda level. And, also the accent of the suffix the pratyayasvāra will be considered as the head at the svāra level. And, this concept of head also gets expressed in the respective levels by those respective elements. And therefore, then the structure of these levels also gets defined as well. We shall study this aspect later on when we now look at the compositionality of śabda and the compositionality of svāra.

To close as is our practice we recite the maṅgalācaraṇa taken from the celebrated text in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition. In this lecture we have selected the maṅgalācaraṇa which appears at the beginning of an important text called Paribhāṣenduśekhara which is composed by NāgeśaBhaṭṭa and the maṅgalācaraṇa is "natvā sambarṁ śivarṁ brahma nāgeśaḥ kurute sudhīḥ, bālānāṁ sukhābodhāya paribhāṣenduśekharam". I repeat "natvā sambarṁ śivarṁ brahma nāgeśaḥ kurute sudhīḥ, bālānāṁ sukhābodhāya paribhāṣenduśekharam".

And, as is also our practice today we shall recite the 5 sūtra at the beginning of the 3rd subchapter of the 5th chapter. The 5th adhyāya and the 3rd pāda the first 5 sūtra and they are prāgdiśo vibhaktiḥ, kiṃsarvanāmabahubhyo'dvyāḍibhyaḥ, idama íś, etetau rathoḥ, etado'n. I repeat, prāgdiśo vibhaktiḥ, kiṃsarvanāmabahubhyo'dvyāḍibhyaḥ, idama íś, etetau rathoḥ, etado'n.

Thank you for your attention.