

Course Name: 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'
Professor Name: Prof. Malhar Arvind Kulkarni
Department Name: Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS)
Institute Name: IIT Bombay
Week:06
Lecture:27

Welcome, I welcome you all to this lecture in the course Introduction to Pāṇinian grammar. In this lecture we are studying the process of speech production and we have spent considerable amount of time in studying the sources namely; Pāṇinīyaśikṣā whose verse namely, "ātmā buddhyā sametyārthān mano yuñkte vivakṣayā manaḥ kāyāgnim āhanti sa prerayati mārutaṁ " is at the base of this discussion. Then mārutastūrasī caran mandraṁ janayati svaram sodīrṇo mūrdhnyabhihato vaktramāpadya mārutaḥ varṇān janayate", these are the other lines, other sources which we are studying.

And we classified this information into the following 8 stages: the 1st stage being ātmā buddhyā sametyārthān that is the 1st stage. mano yuñkte vivakṣayā is the 2nd. manaḥ kāyāgnim āhanti is the 3rd. sa prerayati mārutaṁ is the 4th. 5th is mārutastūrasī caran mandraṁ janayati svaram. 6th is sodīrṇo mūrdhnyabhihato. 7th is vaktramāpadya mārutaḥ and and varṇān janayate is 8th. Out of them we have so far studied the first one in quite a detail. There are many more details that will be covered in the advanced course, right now, we have focused on the 2nd mano yuñkte vivakṣayā, the 2nd stage and this is what we shall be studying in this lecture.

So, what is manas is mind, yuñkte is enjoins and vivakṣayā is by the desire to speak; mano is the 1 slash 1 of manas, yuñkte is the 3 p slash 1 of the verbal root yuj meaning to connect or to enjoin. So, the meaning of this line is having collected the meanings, which was the earlier stage now the ātmā enjoins the mind with the desire to speak.

So, the doer of the action of enjoining or connecting is ātmā, taken from the previous line and the previous stage as well. So, it is the ātmā which collects the meaning by the intellect and now it is enjoining the mind by the desire to speak. These are the basic stages in this process of speech production.

Now, let us study, what this assumes? This assumes the very first stage, namely the collection of meanings being complete by the intellect. Now, the soul has decided what to speak, that is the content is decided. In response to the situation presented and now whether this content needs to be expressed through speech signals or not is also decided by the soul.

Now once it is decided by the soul to express these collected meanings through speech signals then comes this second stage namely *mano yunkte vivakṣayā*, what this assumes is the existence of mind and we have seen when we studied the cognitive apparatus as stated by the Indian philosophical systems in general the function of mind, that is to carry back and forth the signals received from the sense organs and pass them on to the intellect where intellect studies them, analyses them, takes a call whether to proceed towards that object or not or whether to back off and the intellect then passes this signal onto the mind and the mind in its turn passes them on to the sense organs.

This is the general process and then the current description assumes the existence of mind which undergoes these functions and these steps. The job of mind is to carry the decision taken at the level of intellect to sense organ; to execute what is decided and take the input back to the intellect this happens recursively. The desire to speak that is the desire to express oneself this is also assumed in the description that we have studied in the previous slide, these are the things that are assumed.

Now the next question is, so what does this assume? It also assumes the concept of *vivakṣā*, the mechanism of *vivakṣā* and then the next question is what is *vivakṣā*? So, *vivakṣā* is a part of the intellect, a decision is taken at the level of intellect to express the collected meaning and then a form of intellect which is delimited by space and time which sees the world through its spatial and temporal limitations and then this desire is conveyed to the mind to take it forward. So, this is at the level of intellect.

Now, we need to study further, what is *vivakṣā*, and what are the functions of *vivakṣā*? Let us do that now, what is *vivakṣā*? *vivakṣā* is translated as the desire to speak. Now, this mechanism plays a very crucial role also in the collection of meanings. This is the zoom or the focus of the intellect which helps select particular meanings only in response to explicit situation over some other meanings, that is what it is the zoom or the focus and because it is part of the intellect it also plays an important role in the collection of meanings.

Now, this mechanism also involved first of all a decision to express what one has collected, the other side can be a decision to not to express what is collected depending on the communication environment. Now, the second part is to select particular meaning items from the *arthākāśa* and specific word items linked to it from the *śabdākāśa*.

Once it is decided to express the meanings collected then the second part comes into being where particular meaning items are selected from the *arthākāśa* and the specific word items which are linked to this *arthākāśa* are also selected from the *śabdākāśa*. This mechanism is at the core of

what is called a view of an individual, where one external reality can be looked at by two individuals into distinct and sometimes opposite views. So, this reflects their viewpoint or their world view this is what is primarily the function of the vivakṣā.

Let us take a concrete example; so, an individual who looks at a tree with dry leaves and so on in front of him and then he reacts it reacts to it in a particular line in Sanskrit, which is on the left hand side. He says, 'śuṣko vṛkṣastiṣṭhyatyagre', here stands in front of me a dry tree, now the same tree is being looked at by somebody else and he composes another line, 'vilasati taruriha prāptavasante', here shines a tree at the advent of spring; so, the same fact but recorded in different wordings, representing different kinds of arthākāśa.

So, what is the explanation of both these lines? Both sentences are describing a tree with dry leaves; one view is content with the description of the basic physical condition of the tree and the other view is showing something more than the physical condition, namely a ray of hope by saying that this is just the beginning of the spring and the tree may grow as the spring season goes in full swing and then we can see green leaf once again and this state will get modified.

So, these two sentences can be looked at representing two diametrically opposite views namely, an optimism versus pessimism 'śuṣko vṛkṣastiṣṭhyatyagre', it is the sign of pessimism which is the sign of the mental state of the speaker of that line whereas, 'vilasati taruriha prāptavasante' can be seen as the sign of optimism that exists in the mind of the speaker of this line that the speaker is optimistic of the change the new beginning and so on.

So, this is how the vivakṣā can be explained, causing difference in the world view of speakers. So, this optimism versus pessimism is caused because of the overall world view of the speaker, overall vivakṣā of the speakers. Now, what is the philosophical analysis of vivakṣā? As we have seen, as we have studied before, the cognitive apparatus consists of ātman at the core which is animate 'cetana', which is existent 'sat' and also which is full of joy or bliss ānanda.

Now, the concept of vivakṣā can be studied in relation to the nature of the ātman described in this cognitive process. The ātmā is considered to be animate or 'cetana' in nature, this animate nature is self illuminated you do not need anything else to enlighten this, it is enlightened by itself; however, in some cases this nature gets covered by the impressions of the external world gathered through the sense organs coming into contact with the sense objects, sense domain.

So, this impression or this information covers this nature of the cetana ātman. This cover is directly proportional to the amount of clarity in the nature of soul to cognize the certain object.

Now this clarity or un-clarity brings about the world view of that individual speaker and in its turn we can say that this clarity or un-clarity brings about the concept of vivakṣā or the mechanism of vivakṣā.

Now, what are the functions of vivakṣā represents the viewpoint of the speaker. It brings out lexical meaning items and arranges them in a structure. Correspondingly it also brings together the lexical word items and arranges them in a particular structure. Therefore, vivakṣā can be said to capture arthākāśa in a specific unit and vivakṣā can also be said to capture in a śabdākāśa specific unit, that seems to be the primary function of vivakṣā.

The next important function of vivakṣā is assigning roles, what does this mean? The concept of vivakṣā or the mechanism of vivakṣā assigns different roles to different entities, in the accomplishment of an action. Remember this is still part of the arthākāśa, there are arthākāśa consisting of artha which are assigned different roles in order to accomplish an action which is also part of the arthākāśa.

Now, some entities might play the role of the doer of the action namely kartā; some entities can play the role of the effect of the action namely the karma; some can play the role of the most effective instrument namely the karaṇa; some can play the role of the substratum namely the adhikaraṇa and so on and so forth.

So, different entities in this manner can be assigned different roles to perform in the accomplishment of a particular action and this assignment of role is done by vivakṣā. As we shall study later on the Mahābhāṣya of Patañjali which is the latter important source in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition says, 'vivakṣātaḥ kārakāṇi bhavanti', the karaka that is the roles they come into being because of vivakṣā and we shall study how this happens later on in detail when we study the term kāraka and various kārakas.

Let us continue studying the functions of vivakṣā namely assigning different roles. So, if a speaker has collected meaning namely the action of going in response to a particular situation, the vivakṣā mechanism will now decide on the different roles, different entities will play in bringing about the action of going. For example, Rāma and Caitra etcetera which are parts of arthākāśa and also śabdākāśa will be selected to play the role of doer of this action.

Similarly, grāma and śālā which are also parts of arthākāśa and śabdākāśa will be selected to play the role of the effect of an action, of going namely having reached the place. So, in this manner the speaker may want to assign different other roles to different other entities in the same

action or the speaker may want to construct a sentence meaning plus sentence with only these two roles namely, one who performs the action the doer namely kartā and the effect of the action and that is karma; the substratum of the effect of action and that is karma.

So, the speaker may want to construct the sentence meaning and sentence with only these two roles kartā karma or he may want to assign different other roles karanā adhikarāṇa etcetera to different other entities both options are possible. Now, deciding on the number of roles needed as part of the sentence meaning in response to a situation in the stage of collection of meanings is also the function of vivakṣā.

And also deciding on the necessary and sufficient conditions regarding meanings related to the sentence and sentence meaning is also the function of vivakṣā which is also part of the arthākāśa. The other functions of vivakṣā are also noted down on this slide: zooming in on the parts of a description and describing a part of an action in detail in which; obviously, there are certain parts which are omitted.

So, omitting certain parts of an action that is also part of the vivakṣā, even ignoring certain aspects of the fact that is also brought about by vivakṣā alone; what this eventually means is it is because of the vivakṣā that something is made predominant in a description and something is also made subordinate in the same description.

All these they are the functions of vivakṣā, I will read this again the function of vivakṣā is zooming in on certain parts of a description; that means, describing it in detail and also omitting certain parts of an action, also ignoring certain aspects of the fact; thereby making something predominant and at the same time making something subordinate this is an important function of vivakṣā.

For example if we take the action of cooking which involves so many sub actions, for example, taking a vessel putting some rice into it, then putting some water into it, then putting the vessel on the gas stove, then putting it on, then waiting for the water to get warm and then to boil and then also the grains to move and then finally, the grains to become soft and then probably closing the gas putting some cover on the vessel and so on and so forth. These many sub actions are described by the word pacati meaning cooking so, cooking involves all these actions and sub actions. Now, if each is decided to be the focus by the speaker you can also describe all actions together by the word 'pacati' or a speaker may want to focus on one of the actions.

Let us say the speaker wants to highlight the fact of the softening of rice or the speaker may want to highlight the fact of the amount of gas amount of flame used for cooking and so on and so forth, particular kinds of grains being used for the action of cooking and so on. Now, each sub part can be further discussed with further details each part can be described also with omission of certain details. So, while you are describing certain actions with zoom certain sub actions with some focus at the same time you will be describing the same action with omission of certain other details. So, each part can also be described with ignoring some details, so some details will be ignored.

Thus we can say that the vivakṣā reflects the individuality of a person. A person can finally, say that I am saying something because I want to or because that is what I wish to say with no scope for further questioning, what it reflects is the world of an individual. So, if you take the same example of the action of cooking the speaker may finally, say that I am saying this because I want to because that is what I wish to say. So, we can use the word cooking for describing some story and we can say that what is cooking when we are actually referring to some story being developed in an artificial manner. And we can still say the story is being cooked or the there is this cooking of this story going on. Now, you cannot ask further questions because the individual will say that this is what I want to say this is what is my vivakṣā, this is what is my individuality, this is what is the world of an individual, that is what is captured primarily by the function of vivakṣā.

The mechanism of vivakṣā sometimes jumps over the limits of congruity that is vivakṣā and also expectancy that is ākāṅkṣā and meanings which have no straightforward chance of ever coming together in a combination they get collected; remember we said that at the initial stage it is only those meanings, which are congruent with each other stand some chance of getting collected together, but because of vivakṣā, even those meanings which have no such chance can also get collected in the combination and also they can be arranged in a structure; this is because of vivakṣā.

Now, this becomes routine in the course of time, but speakers when questioned admit the invalidity and the path that connects the incongruous items, sometimes we use sentences, we use arthākāśa and express it in the course of time as a matter of routine where no two items which stand any chance of coming together because of the incongruity involved are coming together, but that becomes a routine in the course of time, but that does not mean that the speakers do not recognize it.

When the speakers are questioned they admit the invalidity and the incongruity and the path that is required to connect the incongruous items. Such a collection of meanings in which two incongruous items are collected together is called either invalid collection of meanings or

containing beauty and then such a meaning when expressed inaudible speech or through other means of expression is called work of art or great work of art or sometimes even culture.

Whereas invalid collection of meanings is ignored and looked at as an example of what should be avoided when speaking. So, for example, mukha which means face and candra which means moon they are parts of the arthākāśa which are not related; mukha is the body part candra is part of the solar system, the planetary system.

Now, they are also not part of the related or śabdākāśa because they are not parts of the arthākāśa which are related, but the vivakṣā principle or mechanism can bring them together because the individual thinks like that. And then it can create a new arthākāśa as well as new śabdākāśa where they both are interrelated and then the resultant collection of meanings can be called poetic beauty; in Sanskrit we will say, 'mukhaṁ candraḥ' The Face is moon.

So, some poet is describing the face of his beloved when he uses this phrase and says that the face is moon, every individual knows that the face is not moon there is high level of incongruity between the face and moon for them to be identified in this manner, still it is the vivakṣā of this speaker which brings them together in the relation of identity that the face is moon and this is then considered as a poetic beauty, a beautiful description of the face of the beloved 'mukhaṁ candraḥ', this is in fact, called an ornament of poetry alankāra which we shall study later on.

To summarise, vivakṣā is an important stage in the process of speech production. It embodies the world view of the speaker; it assigns different roles to different individual entities in relation to different actions. It jumps over sometimes the normal rules of congruity and the mind is directed to proceed further to subsequent physical processes following this vivakṣā which we shall study in the next lecture.

Thank you for your attention.