

Course Name: 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'
Professor Name: Prof. Malhar Arvind Kulkarni
Department Name: Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS)
Institute Name: IIT Bombay
Week:04
Lecture:17

Welcome. I welcome you all to this lecture in the course Introduction to Pāṇinian grammar. We are studying the features of the Meta Language. And we are also studying as an important part of it, the concept of 'it', the concept of a marker. We have seen that this 'it' or marker is very effectively used by Pāṇini to form another technical term which is generically referred to as a pratyāhāra like 'ak', 'ac', 'hal', 'ik', 'yaṇ' etcetera. This technical term allows Pāṇini to describe linguistic phenomena, facts of object language related to certain sound set in a very concise manner. We have also seen how these pratyāhāras are formed and the role of 'it' in it.

Then as an important feature of the Meta language of Pāṇini which is different than the object language, we started studying the definition of 'it' provided by Pāṇini himself in his Aṣṭādhyāyī and mind you, this is the beginning of any grammatical learning traditionally in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition, be it the Kaumudī tradition or be it the Kāśikā tradition, it is these 'its', the markers and the pratyāhāras, they are taught right at the beginning. If you master this technique, if you know which sound coming at the end of an element is marked as 'it' by which sūtra half the battle is won, that is the feeling a student gets after he studies these sūtras and after he enters the grammar of Pāṇini. So, we have studied 1.3.2 which termed a vowel which is also assigned the feature of nasality as 'it'.

Then we also studied how consonants at the end of different verbal elements, be it a nominal root, a prātipadika or a verbal root, a dhātu or a suffix, a pratyaya or an augment, an āgama is termed as 'it' and we have seen examples, which illustrate this particular point.

We also saw the negation, so which sounds at the end of the verbal elements are not to be termed as 'it' and that in a very restricted very limited domain namely 'vibhakti' and the sound set which is not to be termed as 'it' is: 'ta varga = ta-tha-da-dha-na', 's' and 'm'. These 7 sounds are not to be termed as 'it' when found at the end of the verbal elements, namely the pratyayas, the vibhakti-pratyayas. After seeing these two sūtras, we also summarized by saying that there should be an 'ekavākyatā' that should be made of both these sūtras and then we can get the meaning about the sūtras, the meaning of the sūtras dealing with the technical term 'it'.

So, now the topic, broad topic that we are dealing with is the markers in the meta language of Pāṇinian grammar and the consonant markers. These are the sūtras which deal with, which define the consonant markers and out of these we have already seen these two sūtras, 'na vibhaktau tasmāḥ' and 'halantyam'. Now, today we shall see these next sūtras in which some other questions get addressed.

For example, we raise these questions. Can the technical term 'it' be stated to consonants other than final? Is it possible to term a consonant 'it' which appears at the beginning of an element? And is it possible to term a cluster of vowel and consonant as 'it'? So, let us study these questions in the light of these two sūtras in detail. First, we take up 1.3.5 for our study.

1.3.5 is 'ādirñiṭṭavaḥ', 'ādirñiṭṭavaḥ'. In this sūtra there are two 'padas' that are visible, one is 'ādiḥ' and the other one is 'ñiṭṭavaḥ', 'ādir-ñi-ṭu-ḍa-vaḥ'. This is a very special character, special symbol and a special sound. This one, this is a nasal consonant in the 'ca' class and to be pronounced as 'ñ', so 'ñiṭṭavaḥ'. Now 'ādiḥ' is 1/1 of 'ādi' meaning initial and 'ñiṭṭavaḥ' is 1 slash 3 of 'ñiṭṭu' is a compound word made up of three components namely 'ñi' and 'ṭu' and 'ḍu', 'ñi-ṭu-ḍu' and this is 1 slash 3 of 'ñi-ṭu-ḍu', 'ñi-ṭu-ḍa-vaḥ'.

Now, we have two words in 1 slash 3, the two words that continue from the previous sūtra are 'upadeśe' and 'it'. So now the meaning of this sūtra is "upadeśe ādayhaḥ ñiṭṭavaḥ itsamjñāḥ syuḥ"; "in the initial enunciation 'ñi', 'ṭu' and 'ḍu' at the beginning of a verbal element are termed 'it'". I repeat, in the initial enunciation 'ñi', 'ṭu' and 'ḍu' at the beginning of a verbal element are termed 'it'.

So, the next point is what is this 'ñi', 'ṭu' and 'ḍu'? Let us study them one by one. So, we observe that they are nothing but the clusters, consonant plus vowel. So, 'ñi' is made up of a consonant 'ñ', the 5th consonant in second row that is 'ca', 'ca' class and vowel 'i', both these together are termed as 'it' as a cluster 'ñi'.

The element which has 'ñi' as 'it' in the initial position will be then called 'ñīt', 'ñi-it', an element which as 'ñi' as 'it' is called 'ñīt' and this will qualify another verbal element which possesses this property. So, for example, if a verbal root has 'ñi' at the beginning, so this verbal route will be called 'ñīt', 'ñīt dhātuh' and so on and then this feature will be used to trigger certain grammatical operation for example, 3.2.187. What is this?

3.2.187 is 'ñītaḥ ktaḥ'. what this sūtra means is that add a suffix 'kta' after a verbal root having 'ñī' it' in the sense of present tense. So, 'kta' added in the sense of present tense after a verbal root which has 'ñī' as 'it', 'ñī' cluster. Generally the suffix 'kta' is added to a verbal root in the sense of past tense, but the exceptions are treated by 3.2.187 notably the verbal roots which have 'ñī' at the beginning as 'it'.

So, the example is 'ñīmidā' over here, 'ñīmidā', this is the verbal root and as you can observe 'ñī' as a cluster appears at the beginning of this verbal root. So, this 'ñī' will be termed as 'it' and this 'ā' at the end is termed as 'it' by 1.3.2 and after we delete these two we get the verbal root 'mid'. And the suffix 'kta' is added to it and this 'k' will be termed as 'it' by 1.3.8 which we shall study later on and then it will be deleted and you will get the form 'ta'. So, we will get 'mid' plus 'ta' as the next step in the derivation.

Further doing some more processing on this we will get the form 'minna', 'minna', something which is getting anointed now in the present tense, that will be the meaning of 'minna'. So, this 'ta' suffix will denote the present tense and not the past tense, why? Because it has marker 'ñī' at the beginning. And so, 'ñītaḥ ktaḥ' gets triggered and so, we get this meaning derived from this word.

Let us look at 'ṭu' as a 'it'. So, 'ṭu' is also a cluster. It is made up of consonant 'ṭ' and vowel 'u', both these together are termed 'it' by 1.3.5, the element which has 'ṭu' as 'it' together in the initial position will be called 'ṭvit', an element which has 'ṭu' as 'it' is called 'ṭvit' and this will qualify another verbal element which possesses this property. So, a verbal root dhātu will be called 'ṭvit', 'ṭvit dhātuḥ' and then this feature will be used to trigger certain grammatical operation, for example 3.3.89 which is 'ṭvito athuc', 'ṭvito athuc'.

what this sūtra means is at the suffix 'athuc' which has 'c' coming at the end as 'it' by of course, 1.3.3 though. So, the suffix that is visible in the object language is 'athu'. So, add the suffix 'athu' after a verbal route having 'ṭvit' in the sense of 'bhāva' that is state. Let us look at 3.3.89. 3.3.89 is 'ṭvito athuc', 'ṭvito athuc'.

The meaning of this sūtra is add the suffix 'athuc' in which 'c' coming at the end is termed as 'it' by 1.3.3. So, the suffix that is visible in the object language is 'athu'. So, add the suffix 'athuc' after a verbal root having 'ṭu' as 'it' in the sense of 'bhāva' that is a state. So, for example, we have a verbal root stated in the dhātupāṭha as 'ṭuveṛṇ kampāne', 'ṭuveṛṇ kampāne' that is to tremble. So, here is a verbal route 'ṭuveṛṇ' at the beginning of which appears a cluster 'ṭu' and at the end appears 'ṛ'. This 'ṛ' will be termed 'it' by 1.3.2, because this is stated to be a nasal and coming to this beginning 'ṭu', it will be stated, it will be termed an 'it' by 1.3.5 'ādirñīṭuḍavaḥ', so this is 'ṭu',

this is 'it'. When we delete both these markers we get the verbal root 'vep' to tremble, then we add 1.3 by 3.3.89, we add the suffix 'athuc', then 'c' is marked as 'it' and it is deleted. So, we get the form 'vepathu', the state of trembling 'vepathu', "vpathuśca śarīre me romaharṣaśca jāyate" as Arjuna says in 'Śrīmadbhagavadgītā' first chapter, 'vepathu', trembling the state of trembling.

Now, let us look at 'ḍu' coming at the beginning of a verbal element which is termed as 'it' by 1.3.5 'ādirñiṭuḍavaḥ' is once again made up of a cluster consonant 'ḍ' and vowel 'u', both these together are termed as 'it' by this sūtra 1.3.5.

The element which has 'ḍu' as 'it' in the initial position will be called now 'ḍvit', an element which has 'ḍu' as 'it'. This will qualify another verbal element which possesses this particular property namely 'ḍvit'. So, a dhātu will be called 'ḍvit', 'ḍvit dhātuḥ' and this feature will be used to trigger certain grammatical operation for example, 3.3.88.

So, what is 3.3.88? 3.3.88 is 'ḍvitaḥ kṛiḥ', 'ḍvitaḥ kṛiḥ'. What this means is add the suffix 'tri' and 'k' becomes 'it' by 1.3.8, we shall study this later on; so the suffix that is visible in the object language is 'tri' only. So, add the suffix 'tri' after a verbal root having 'ḍu-it' in the sense of bhāva, that is a state, the example is 'ḍukṛñ', 'ḍukṛñ karaṇe', 'ḍukṛñ' means to do.

So, what is 'ḍukṛñ'? 'ḍukṛñ' has two 'it' elements, one at the beginning and one at the end. This end 'ñ' which is a consonant will be termed 'it' by 1.3.3 'halantyaṃ'. Now, coming to this 'ḍu', this entire 'ḍu' will be termed 'it' by this 1.3.5 'ādirñiṭuḍu', 'ādirñiṭuḍavaḥ'. So, this root is called 'ḍvit'. So, the verbal root we get is 'kṛ' after removing the markers, the 'its', 'ḍu' and 'ñ'. Now we add the suffix 'tri' which is triggered by this 'ḍu' by 3.3.88 and so, we get the stage 'kṛ' plus 'tri'.

So, we remove the marker 'k' over here and we get 'kṛ' plus 'tri'. So, we get the word 'kṛtri', the state of doing and by applying 4.4.20, we add this 'ma' immediately after this 'kṛtri' and so we get the word 'kṛtrima'. 'Kṛtrima' means something generated by the state of doing. So, you have to do something to generate that means artificial something that is not natural not as it is, 'kṛtrima' is artificial.

This is how the word 'kṛtrima' gets generated, because the verbal root 'kṛ' is 'ḍvit', so you add the suffix 'tri' and so you add the other suffix 'ma' to it. So, these are the examples of 'ñi', 'ṭu' and 'ḍu' clusters coming at the beginning of the verbal elements.

Let us ah summarize what we have studied so far. So, 1.3.5 'ādirñiṭuḍavaḥ', this sūtra assigns the technical term 'it' to not an individual sound, but to a cluster consonant plus vowel. Thus it becomes a unique sūtra in this set as no other sūtra does this. Each and every other sūtra in this set assigns the technical term 'it' to only an individual sound. This is the only sūtra in this set which terms a cluster an 'it'. However there are some more clusters which are not explicitly assigned the term 'it' in the text of Aṣṭādhyāyī. Such clusters however, are assumed to be known and are used in the sūtras in the Aṣṭādhyāyī.

For example 'ir', 'ir' is a cluster which is made up of vowel 'i' and consonant 'r' is termed 'it' and this term 'it' to 'ir' is never explicitly stated in the Aṣṭādhyāyī that is Pāṇinian grammar, but it is assumed by the sūtra 'irito vā' 3.1.57 in the Aṣṭādhyāyī. Now, the later commentators had to fill in this gap by adding a statement "ira itsamjñā vācyā". The technical term 'it' should be assigned to this entire cluster 'ir' in order to justify this mention of Pāṇini 'irito vā'. This is how sūtra 1.3.5 assigns the technical term 'it' to these clusters. We have studied the examples which show how the 'it' term applied to 'ñi', 'ṭu' and 'ḍu' functions that is what does it bring about, what sūtra what grammatical operations it triggers and the final forms derived by such sūtras.

Let us now proceed to study the next sūtra in the set which also assigns the technical term 'it' to a particular consonant single consonant at the beginning of a verbal element. The sūtra is 1.3.6 which is 'ṣaḥ pratyayasya'. This sound, this is to be pronounced as 'ṣa' and not to be confused with 'śa' or 'sa', 'śa' or 'sa', this is not that, this is 'ṣa', 'ṣaḥ pratyayasya'. There are two words in the sūtra, one is 'ṣaḥ' and the other one is 'pratyayasya'. 'ṣaḥ' is 1 slash 1 and 'pratyayasya' is 6 slash 1. 'ṣaḥ' is 1 slash 1 of 'ṣa', 'ṣa' together with vowel 'a', however this stands for the sound 'ṣ' which is a consonant for the sake of convenience the sound 'ṣ' is mentioned together with 'a', but this entire symbol stands for only this consonant 'ṣ' and 'pratyayasya' is 6 slash 1 of the word 'pratyaya' that is a suffix, this 6 slash 1 has the same meaning as it has in the object language namely 'of'.

So, the words continued in the previous from the previous sūtra are 'upadeśe' which is in 7 slash 1, 'it' and 'ādiḥ' from the previous sūtra. So, the meaning of this sūtra is "upadeśe pratyayasya ādiḥ ṣaḥ itsamjñāḥ syāt" meaning meaning thereby that the sound 'ṣa' at the beginning of a 'pratyaya' in the initial enunciation is termed 'it'. The sound 'ṣa' at the beginning of a 'pratyaya' in the initial enunciation is termed 'it'.

So, now, 'ṣa' in the initial position in the 'upadeśa', but not each and every verbal element which has 'ṣa' at the beginning is termed as 'it'. It is only the 'pratyaya' at the beginning of which 'ṣa' appears and then it can be termed as 'it,' that is all. So, the domain is very limited now.

Let us look at the example where 'sa' is marked as 'it.' The example is 4.1.17 and the sūtra is 'prācām śphaḥ taddhitaḥ', 'prācām śphaḥ taddhitaḥ'. 'prācām' is 6.3 of 'prāc'. 'śphaḥ' is 1.1 of 'śpha' and 'taddhitaḥ' is 1.1 of 'taddhita'; words continued are 'pratyayaḥ' from 3.1.1, 'striyām' from 4.1.3 and 'yañāḥ' that is 5 slash 1 from the previous sūtra 4.1.16. So, now the meaning of this 4.1.17 is a suffix 'śpha' is added after a word ending in suffix 'yañ' in the sense of feminine and this suffix is called 'taddhita', this suffix 'śpha' is called 'taddhita'.

So, let us look at the word derived by applying this sūtra. We start the derivation with the word 'Garga', the name of a particular person a sage, we add the suffix 'yañ' to it by 4.1.105. And then we get the word form 'Gārgya'. 'Gārgya' means a descendant of 'Garga'. The suffix 'yañ' has 'ñ' at the end which is termed 'it' by 1.3.3 and then it is deleted.

So, 'Garga' plus 'yañ' by 4.1.105, then this 'ñ' is termed as 'it' and deleted. So, you get 'Garga' plus 'ya', then you then this 'ñ' triggers the operation where this initial vowel is lengthened by 7.2.115. So, you get the form 'Gārga' plus 'ya' that is the next step, then because of this 'ya' this final 'a' gets deleted. So, you get now 'Gārg' plus 'ya' by 6.4.148 and so you get the form 'Gārgya' meaning a descendant of 'Garga'.

What happens to this? Now, we add the suffix 'śpha' by 4.1.17. So you have 'Gārgya' plus 'śpha'. This 'ś' now at the beginning of a 'pratyaya' will be termed as 'it' by this sūtra 'śaḥ pratyayasya' and then it will be deleted by 'tasya lopaḥ'. so, you get 'Gārgya' plus 'pha'. Then we add the feminine suffix 'ñīṣ' in which which 'ś' comes at the end here we will not apply this sūtra; why? because even though 'ś' is there and finally, it is a marker, but it is coming at the end of the pratyaya, whereas this sūtra is stating the term 'it' to 'ś' which comes only at the beginning of a pratyaya, like here, here it is coming at the end. So, the 'ś' will not get itsamjñā because of this sūtra. It will become 'it' by 1.3.3.

So now, by applying 7.1.2 we will replace this initial consonant 'pha' by 'āyan' and so we will get 'Gārgya' plus 'āyana' plus 'ñīṣ'. Then this 'ñ' initial will be termed as 'it' by 1.3.8 and 'ś' will be termed as 'it' by 1.3.3 and they will be deleted and finally, you will get 'Gārgya' plus 'āyana' plus 'ī' and by applying 6.4.148 we will have 'Gārgy' plus 'āyan' plus 'ī'. So you will get 'Gārgy' plus 'āyan' plus 'ī' by applying 8.4.2 and finally, we will get the form 'Gārgyāyanī', a female descendant of Garga.

So, let us not go into the details of all these meanings which will be explained later on. Right now for us what is important is 'śpha' is a suffix, is a pratyaya at the beginning of which appears 'ś' which is termed as 'it' by this sūtra and this triggers the operation namely addition of the suffix

'ñīṣ' by 4.1.41 'ṣidgaurādibhyaśca' in which 'ṣit' is used because this suffix is 'ṣit' having 'ṣ' as 'it', therefore this 'ñīṣ' is added.

Let us summarize what we said about 4.1.17 is that, 'ṣpha' is a 'ṣ' occurs at its beginning and therefore is termed 'it' by 1.3.6 and is deleted by 1.3.9. This pratyaya is then called 'ṣit' which triggers the operation stated by 4.1.41 namely 'ṣidgaurādibhyaśca'. This 4.1.41 adds the suffix 'ñīṣ' and we get the form 'Gārgyāyaṇī'.

To summarize what we have said so far, what we have studied so far, we can say that 1.3.5 and 6, both assign the technical term 'it' to word initial elements. 1.3.5 assigns the term to a cluster 'c' plus 'v' consonant plus vowel and 1.3.6 assigns the technical term 'it' to the sound 'ṣ', individual sound 'ṣ'. Both these elements then trigger the grammatical operation. They are used by Pāṇini to trigger certain grammatical operations. Then we shall study the remaining two sūtras in the coming lecture. Thank you for your attention.