

Course Name: 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'
Professor Name: Prof. Malhar Arvind Kulkarni
Department Name: Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS)
Institute Name: IIT Bombay
Week:04
Lecture: 16

Welcome. I welcome you all to this lecture in the course 'Introduction to Pāṇinian grammar'. We are studying the features of the meta language of Pāṇinian grammar and we noted 3 features namely: meaning of the word who is head and who is subordinate, in the object language it is the meaning meaning which is the head and the word form is the subordinate. The 2nd feature was the meaning of the cases, 5th, 6th and 7th in the object language the 5th case is translated with the help of the word 'from'. In the meta language however, the same 5th case in addition to this meaning in the object language also means immediately after and this meaning is in correspondence with the first difference that is the word form as a meaning is the head. The 6th case in the object language stands for or is translated with the help of the word 'of', in the meta language 6th case is translated using the word 'instead of' or 'in place of'. The 7th case in the object language is translated with the help of the word 'in' or 'on' in the meta language. The 7th case, in addition to these is also translated as immediately before. The third important feature of the meta language was forming the 'pratyāhāra', the technique of 'pratyāhāra'. This is a technical term used by Pāṇini, which in a concise manner refers to a huge set of sounds which are part of a grammatical operation, be it an environment left hand side or right hand side or the major grammatical operation namely the substitution; it could be a substituent or it could be the substitute.

After studying these important features, we started to study in detail the technical term 'it' and we will continue studying it further in this lecture. So, markers in the meta language of Pāṇinian grammar that is the broad theme we are looking at and today we shall deal with consonant markers. In the previous lecture we saw how vowels are termed as markers by which sūtra and we then also looked at the examples. Today we shall study the sūtras in the Pāṇini's Aṣṭādhyāyī, the Pāṇinian grammar which talk about consonant markers.

So, the in all there are these sūtras which talk about the technical term 'it', the technical term 'it' is defined in this set of sūtras. Now, we shall study these sūtras, it is these sūtras which primarily define the consonant marker. We have already seen 1.3.2 which defines the vowel marker 'upadeśe ac anunāsika it'. Today we shall focus on the consonant markers and on the first two sūtras.

Let us study the first sūtra which defines a mark marker, a consonant marker and that sūtra is 'halantyam'. We have studied this sūtra before in brief when we studied the technique of forming the 'pratyāhāra', in which we said that the final consonant of all the 14 sūtras is termed as 'it' and

then using that we form the pratyāhāra 'ac', 'hal', 'al' etcetera. We have studied this in detail before. Let us look at the sūtra in detail now.

So, this is 'halantyam', in which there are two words 'hal' and 'antya', both of them are in the first case 1 slash 1, 'hal' stands for a consonant and we have seen how 'hal' means a consonant, how 'hal' stands for a consonant. 'Hal' is a pratyāhāra formed with 'l' marker at the end of the 14th sūtra and 'ha' coming at the beginning of the 5th sūtra. And so, from that 'ha' up to 'l', all the sounds in between, they are part of 'hal', of course! omitting the markers in between and also the vowels that are produced for distinct comprehension of the consonants.

So, 'hal' stands for a consonant, 'antya' stands for final, 'antya' means final. So, the words continued from previous sūtra are two words: 'upadeśe' as well as 'it' and the meanings of these two words are same as they were in 1.3.2. So, finally, the meaning of this sūtra can be said to be this, 'upadeśe antyaṁ hal itsamjñam syāt', that is the meaning in Sanskrit. So, in English we can say that in the initial enunciation that is the 'upadeśa' a consonant at the end is termed 'it', that seems to be the meaning of this sūtra.

To study this further, we can say that we have seen how the final consonants are termed 'it' in the initial 14 sūtras, this we have seen which help form the other technical terms called 'pratyāhāra' like 'ac', 'hal', 'al', 'ik', 'yaṅ' etcetera. Apart from forming the technical terms called 'pratyāhāra' there are some more purposes, some other purposes of the consonants being termed 'it'.

So, let us look at some of them, but before that we can also enlist where all the consonants at the end in the 'upadeśa' are termed as 'it', some details, for example 'it' consonant at the end of a nominal root, a consonant can occur at the end of a nominal root which can be termed as 'it'. A consonant can come at the end of a verbal root and it can also be termed 'it'. Similarly at the end of a pratyaya you can find a consonant which can be termed as 'it', similarly an augment 'āgama' can also have consonants at the end and that consonant can also be termed as 'it'.

So, prātipadika, dhātu, pratyaya and āgama, they all constitute what is known as 'upadeśa' and a consonant that appears at the end of all these can be termed as 'it' by 1.3.3. Let us look at the examples of each one of them.

The first is the consonant coming at the end of a nominal root or a prātipadika. Let us take the example, 'devat' meaning God. Similarly, 'nadaṭ' meaning a big river. So, as you noticed 'ṭ' at the end appears in both these words and we apply 1.3.3 and this 'ṭ' becomes 'it', this 'ṭ' is termed as 'it'.

So, now, these nominal roots 'deva' and 'nada', they will be called 'ṭit' having 'ṭ' as 'it', that means one who has consonant 'ṭ' as an 'it' as a marker.

What is the purpose of this 'ṭ' over here? What does it trigger? So, now, it triggers 4.1.15 which will add a feminine suffix ॠ in the sense of feminine to this word 'deva' and 'nada' by using 'ṭit' as a trigger. So, this 4.1.15 'ṭit dhāṇañ' and so on, so 'ṭit' is the first word here and this triggers the feminine suffix ॠ to be added to these words. So, we have 'deva' plus ॠ, 'deva' means a god, ॠ is a feminine. So, now we get the word 'devī' and the meaning is goddess, 'nada' plus ॠ and then you get the word 'nadī' which means a river. This is how marker 'ṭ' at the end of a nominal route triggers these operations to derive the other existing words in the object language.

Let us look at the consonants coming at the end of a verbal root and what do they function for. So, consonant at the end of a verbal root or dhāt for example, 'śīṅ svapne' to sleep or 'kuṅ śabde' to make sound, at the end of both these verbal roots 'śīṅ' and 'kuṅ' we notice that 'ṅ' comes at the end. This 'ṅ' appears at the end of these verbal roots and by applying 1.3.3 'ṅ' will be called 'it'.

Therefore, both these roots, verbal roots will be called 'ṅit', 'ṅ - it', those who have 'ṅ - it', that is 'ṅit', both of them are 'ṅit', one who has consonant 'ṅ' as an 'it'. Now, this 'ṅ - it' or 'ṅit' feature will trigger the operation stated by 1.3.12 which adds ātmanepada suffixes to these verbal roots by using 'ṅit' as a trigger, 'anudātta ṅita ātmanepada'. And so from root 'śī' we will get the words 'śete', by adding the ātmanepada suffixes. Similarly, 'kuṅ' will get the word 'kavate' by adding the ātmanepada suffixes.

Now, let us look at how a consonant coming at the end of a 'pratyaya' is termed as 'it' and how does it function, what does it bring about? So, take for example, 'yat', 'yat' as a suffix, we have already seen this 'aco yat', 'yat' is stated in the sense of 'karma' and 'bhāva'; similarly, 'tavyat' stated in the sense of 'karma' and 'bhāva'. So, at the end of these two suffixes 'yat' and 'tavyat' we find 't' consonant and by applying 1.3.3 't' will be termed 'it'. And therefore, these two suffixes will be called 'tit', having 't' as 'it' one who has consonant 't' as an 'it'.

So, after this 6.1.185 applies which marks the final vowel of these 'ya' and 'tavya' as a 'svarita' accent by using 'tit' as a trigger. So, if we add 'ya' to the verbal root 'ci' and we have seen this example, we will get the word form final word form 'ceya', in which this 'ya' will be marked as 'svarita' by 6.1.185 and this is triggered by this 't' marker which comes at the end.

Similarly, if you add 'tavyat' after 'ci' you will get the final word 'cetavya' which will be marked 'svarita' on the final vowel like this, this vertical bar on top is the sign for a 'svarita' accent and we

shall study what 'svarita' accent is later on when we study the process of speech production. Right now, we can say that this vertical bar on top of a letter is the sign of a 'svarita' accent and here it is 'svarita', primarily because 6.1.185 functions over here because both these pratyayas, both these suffixes are having 't' as 't' marker as the 't' coming at the end.

Now, let us look at the consonant coming at the end of an augment. So, we have two examples 'at̄' and 'āt̄' and we notice that 'ṭ' appears at the end of both these augments. Now, by applying 1.3.3 'ṭ' will be called an 'it'. So, these augments will be called 'ṭit', having 'ṭ' as 'it', having 'ṭ' as a marker. Now, 1.1.46, will add these two elements at the beginning of a verbal root by using 'ṭit' as a trigger. So, 'ṭit' will be used and 1.1.46 we will say that, an element which is 'ṭit' is added before. So, you get the form 'abhavat', where 'a' is added to the verbal root 'bhū' at the beginning before.

Similarly, 'ā' will be added to the verbal root 'as' before it, because it is 'ṭit' following 1.1.46. So, now we have seen how the consonants coming at the end they are termed as 'it'. And we have seen examples where consonants coming at the end of a verbal root, a nominal root, a suffix and an augment is termed as 'it' and that leads to various grammatical functions. Because the marker triggers the respective operations stated in the grammatical rules, that was about 1.3.3, we have studied it in detail now.

Now, let us proceed further and look at the next rule which says something about the consonants at the end being termed as markers and this is in fact, a negation. Let us look at the rule. Now 'na vibhaktau tasmāḥ' 1.3.4 'na vibhaktau tasmāḥ', here there are three words in the sūtra, 'na', 'vibhaktau' and 'tasmāḥ'. 'Na' means not, 'vibhaktau' is 7 slash 1 of 'vibhakti' and 'tasmāḥ' is 1 slash 3 of 'tusma'. 'Vibhaktau' here means in the 'vibhakti', this is the object language meaning which is used here.

'Tasmāḥ' is 1 slash 3 of 'tusma'. What is 'tusma'? 'tusma' is a word made up of three components, the 1st one is 'tu', 2nd is 's' and the 3rd one is 'm'. So, what is 'tu'? 'tu' is defined in 1.1.69 to mean 5 consonants of 'ta' class namely the 4th row 'ta tha da dha' and 'na' in the traditional inventory, sound inventory. This is what is 'tu', 's' and 'm' we know. So, the words that are continued from the previous sūtra are these two 'hal' and 'antyam' from 1.3.3.

So, now the meaning of this sūtra is in the vibhakti 'ta', 'tha', 'da', 'dha', 'na', 's' and 'm' at the end are not termed as 'it'. So, this is the negation by the previous sūtra 1.3.3 all these sounds coming at the end of an 'upadeśa', they would be termed as 'it'. But now this sūtra in a limited domain of vibhakti which is also part of the 'upadeśa' states that these 5 plus 2, 7; these 7 sounds they are not to be termed as 'it' in a 'vibhakti'. Otherwise, you can, but not in the 'vibhakti'.

So, what is a 'vibhakti'? That is the next question. So, the term 'vibhakti' is defined by 1.4.104 'sup' and 'tiñ'. According to 1.4.104 'sup' and 'tiñ' are termed 'vibhakti'. What is 'sup'? 'sup' is a set of 21 suffixes added after a nominal root that is by 4.1.2 and 'tiñ' is a set of 18 suffixes added after a verbal root by 3.4.78. And both these suffixes when added to these respective roots make it a 'pada', a word finished word form to be used in a sentence, eligible for using in a sentence. So, 'sup' and 'tiñ' they are called 'vibhaktis'.

There is one more section in the Aṣṭādhyāyī 5.3.1 to 27, the suffixes stated in this section they are also termed as 'vibhakti' and here are some examples 'tral', 'dā', 'dānīm' and 'thāl'. So, now 'l' coming at the end of all the suffix 'tral', 'dā', 'dānīm' and 'thāl', 'l' again coming at the end. Now, in these cases we note that these suffixes are termed as 'vibhaktis'.

So, 'm' coming at the end over here would otherwise have term, have been termed as 'it' by 1.3.2, but now this is 'vibhakti'. So, 'm' coming at the end is not termed as 'it'. Whereas, this 'l' coming at the end over here in both these suffixes this is not part of 1.3.4 and therefore, even though this is a vibhakti, 'l' can still be termed as 'it' and these two suffixes will be termed as 'lit'. And then following and then the function namely accent, a particular kind of accent that will be triggered by this 'l' by this 'lit' suffix, but most importantly 'm' will not be termed as 'it' that is the meaning of 1.3.4.

Let us take a close look at 'sup' and 'tiñ' and see where the consonants coming at the end are not termed as 'it'. So, here are the 21 'sups' for you, 's', 'au', 'as' etcetera and so you see 's' comes at the end, 's' comes at the end here, here 'm' comes at the end here, once again 'm' comes at the end in these three, 's' comes at the end here, 'm' comes here, 's' comes at the end in 6.2.72 and in 5.1.61 's' comes at the end. So, these are the 'vibhaktis' and we note that 's' and 'm' are the two consonants which appear at the end of these 21 suffixes, many of these 21 suffixes and they are not to be termed as 'it'. However, in the same 21 suffixes there is one instance where 'p' comes at the end, 'p' can be called as 'it' that is not mentioned in 1.3.4. So, 'p' can be called as 'it'. So, these are the 21 'sups' and this is the position, this is how 1.3.4 is applied in these 21 suffixes and 'm' and 's' are not termed as 'it'.

As we shall see they are also part of the actual OL object language. So, here are the forms and you see 'Rāmaḥ', 'Rāmau', 'Rāmāḥ' etcetera in these 21 forms 'm' is directly visible in this and these other forms, 'n' is all directly visible over here, 'm' is also visible in 6.3,

't' is visible over here 5.1 and then Rāmaiḥ, Rāmebhyaḥ, Rāmebhyaḥ, Rāmayoḥ, Rāmayoḥ, 's' is also visible over here, 's' is converted to a 'visarga' at the end, similarly 'Rāmaḥ'. In all these cases now we have 'n', 'm', 't', 's', 4 consonants mentioned in 1.3.4, these are all 'subantas' at the end of

which 'sup' comes. Therefore, these are 'subantas'. These are the word forms eligible to be used in a sentence. At the end of them, obviously, 1.3.4 applies and the consonants namely 'm', 'n', 't', 's', they are not termed as 'it'. These forms are, these consonants are visible in the final forms produced in the object language. Whereas, in 7.3 the form is 'Rāmeṣ' where there is no 'p' was there earlier in the meta language and 'p' is termed as 'it' and is deleted, so is not part of the object language. So, 'p' is an 'it', to the rest is not 'it'.

So, we can sum this discussion up by saying that following sounds are not termed as 'it', 't' in 5 slash 1, at the end of 5 slash, 'n' at the end of 2 slash 3, 's' at the end of 1 slash 1, 1 slash 3, 2 slash 3, 3 slash 3, 4 slash 3, 5 slash 1 and 3, 6 slash 1 and 2 and 7 slash 2.

And 'm' at the end of 2 slash 1, 3, 4 and 5 slash 2 and 6 slash 3. So, in these cases these four sounds are not termed as 'it' and 'p' coming at the end of the 7th case, 7 slash 3 is indeed termed as 'it' by application of 1.3.3. So, here is a set of 'tiñ' suffixes, 18 suffixes, they are divided into two groups, that is why this group is named as 3P 3rd person and this is named as 3Pi, 2Pi and 1Pi, just two different sets, each of 9 suffixes 'tip-tas-jhi' etcetera.

If you look at these suffixes, there is 'p' coming in these three suffixes at the end and definitely this is marked as 'it', but 's' coming over here and also here and here and 'm' again coming over here, here because it is coming at the end of a 'vibhakti' is not marked, not termed as 'it', 'ñ' coming at the end over here is termed as 'it'. So, these are the 'tiñanta' forms and you see the the markers, the 'its' have disappeared in these three forms 'nayati', 'nayasi', 'nayāmi', there is no 'p', but 's' is present over here once again converted into the 'visarga', the two dots 'nayataḥ', 'nayathaḥ', 'nayāvaḥ' and 'nayāmaḥ', 's' is converted into a 'visarga' and then say where the final consonance 's' is ah converted into something else and 'nayate' 'nayethe' 'nayadhve'. So, 'm' and 'm' over here once again gets substituted by another substitute. So, the point is these are the 'tiñantas', the 'padas' which are eligible to be used in a sentence because at their final position is a 'tiñ' and within this 'tiñ' 'p' gets the term as 'it' whereas, 's' and 'm', they are not termed as 'it'.

Let us summarize. So, we saw that 's' coming at the end of 3rd person dual, 2nd person dual, 1st person dual and plural, 2nd person ātmanepada singular is not termed as 'it'. 'M' coming at the end of 3rd person ātmanepada dual, 2nd person ātmanepada dual is not termed as 'it' and 'p' coming at the end of 3rd person, 2nd person and 1st person singular and 'ñ' coming at the end of 1st person ātmanepada plural is indeed termed as 'it'.

To summarize, we looked at 1.3.3 and on 1.3.4 which state which consonants at the end of the verbal elements in the initial enunciation are termed 'it'. 1.3.3 is a general statement that states the 'it' to all the consonants at the end of the verbal elements be it a nominal root or a verbal root or a

suffix or an augment. 1.3.4 is a negation and in essence restricts the scope of application of this term to a subset within the set of consonants in the limited domain of 'vibhakti', once again!

So, we note that both 1.3.3 and 1.3.4 are to be construed together and we have seen how it is to be construed, with the concrete examples. This process is also known as 'ekavākyatā'. This 'ekavākyatā' tells us that in the initial enunciation any consonant at the end that is in the final position of a verbal element except 't', 'tha', 'da', 'dha', 'na', 's', 'm' at the end of the 'vibhakti' are termed as 'it'. This is the bottom line. This is the 'ekavākyatā' of 1.3.3 and 1.3.4.

The questions that arise in this discussion are the technical term 'it' is stated to which other consonants at other positions, other than the final. Are they stated are they termed 'it' at the beginning of the verbal elements and also, are there any clusters vowel plus consonant clusters which are termed as 'it'? And we shall study this fact these questions and their answers in the coming lectures.

Let us now end today's lecture as is our practice with the 'maṅgalācaraṇa' taken from a commentary text called 'Prasāda', 'Prakriyāprasāda' on the celebrated text called 'Prakriyā-Kaumudī'. This is a big verse. I will read it for you. "śrīmadviṭṭhalmekamavyayamajam śabdātmakam brahma yaḥ svecchāto jagadubbhavasthitilaye hetuḥ svamāyāguṇaiḥ, yacchvāsaḥ śrutisaṁtativyavahṛtistam puṇḍarīkāśrame bhaktānugrahaḥhetutaḥ sthitamaham vande mude samvide". I will read it again ""śrīmadviṭṭhalmekamavyayamajam śabdātmakam brahma yaḥ svecchāto jagadubbhavasthitilaye hetuḥ svamāyāguṇaiḥ, yacchvāsaḥ śrutisaṁtativyavahṛtistam puṇḍarīkāśrame bhaktānugrahaḥhetutaḥ sthitamaham vande mude samvide".

And finally, 5 sūtras of today taken from 2.4. The 1st sūtra is 'dviḡurekavacanam', then 'dvandvaśca prāṇitūryasenāṅgānām', 'anuvāde caraṇānām', 'adhvaryukraturanapuṁsakam', 'adhyayanato'viprakṛṣṭākhyānām'. I repeat, 'dviḡurekavacanam', 'dvandvaśca prāṇitūryasenāṅgānām', 'anuvāde caraṇānām', 'adhvaryukraturanapuṁsakam', 'adhyayanato'viprakṛṣṭākhyānām'.

Thank you for your attention.