Course Name: 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'
Professor Name: Prof. Malhar Arvind Kulkarni
Department Name: Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS)
Institute Name: IIT Bombay
Week:03
Lecture:15

Welcome, I welcome you all to this lecture in the course 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'. We are studying the features of the meta-language of Pāṇini in which we noted 3 additional important features other than those of the object language in the meta-language of Pāṇini.

The first one was the meaning of a word and what is main and what is subordinate, the second one was the meaning of the cases and the third one was the technique of 'pratyāhāra'. In forming the 'pratyāhāra' we also looked at the concept of a marker or an 'it'. In this lecture we are going to take one step forward in studying this concept of a marker. Because quite a lot depends on the understanding of the way Pāṇini has used markers in the meta-language of his grammar. So, we will study the markers in the meta-language of Pāṇinian grammar in detail now.

So, first question is what is a marker? A marker is a verbal element that is adjoined to another verbal element and the sole purpose of this adjoinment is only to bring out certain grammatical operation. The most important part of this marker is that it is not a part of that element to which it is adjoined in the object language. Even though, it may seem to be a part of that adjoining element in the meta-language that is the most important feature of a marker. A marker is also known in Pāṇinian meta-language as 'it' and we are going to take examples. In fact, we are going to study in detail what an 'it' is or what a marker is wherein it will be clear, how it becomes a part of an element in the meta-language, but is not a part of that element in the object language.

Let us proceed further. So, this marker is known as 'it' in Pāṇinian meta-language. The literal meaning of the word 'it' is one which goes away derived from the verbal root 'i' to go. So, where does it go away? So, it comes to the meaning that 'it' is the one which is not part of the object language, it appears right at the outset as a metalinguistic element and triggers certain grammatical operations and then goes away leaving behind it's mark. It is used only in the Aṣṭādhyāyī in the meta-language of Pāṇinian grammar. We shall study more about this in a while, but let us look at one more term that is used for a marker in the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition, that is 'anubandha'. The literal meaning of 'anubandha' is one which is attached with another element, this term however, we must note that this term is not used explicitly in the Aṣṭādhyāyī what is used is 'it', 'it'. What is the general idea of a marker or an 'it' when said it goes away or is attached to an element?

So, the general idea is the following an 'it' is attached to a verbal element, be it list of nominal roots or list of verbal roots or list of suffixes or list of augments. An 'it' is attached to any of these elements and a rule is created with reference to that 'it' attached to any of these elements in which a particular operation is stated with reference to that 'it' sound. This is the general idea the way a marker or an 'it' sound functions. This is what it brings about.

This is a part of grammatical derivation. So, in the process of grammatical derivation a verbal element containing an 'it' in it is a given as the starting point of the grammatical derivation process. The first grammatical operation that happens on that element is identification of an 'it's within it. Then after an 'it' is identified it is deleted. So, it's deletion is the next part of the grammatical derivational process. So, identification and deletion of an 'it' sound are the beginning of the grammatical derivation process and they do not require any condition or any environment for them to apply that is why they are called in Sanskrit 'anaimittika'.

So, let us come back to the question, what is 'it'? Let us study how this term is defined by Pāṇini and where has he defined it Pāṇini has defined the term 'it' in 1.3.2 to 1.3.8. This is a small section that appears at the beginning of the third pāda which is actually the beginning of the study of the meta-language. I must add a point here that this is how the Pāṇinian grammar is taught in a particular method that I have been teaching with. Once this topic is clear, as to what is an 'it', I have observed that many a students find their own ground in understanding the Pāṇinian grammar better. Therefore, it is extremely important to study this section right at the beginning. It is also to be noted that in addition to 1.3.2 to 8 there is another sūtra 1.3.9 'tasya lopaḥ' and this sūtra states the deletion of 'it'.

What happens to the 'it' after you identify an 'it' using these sūtras 1.3.2 to 8? what happens to it? So, 1.3.9 tells us that such an identified sound gets deleted 'tasya lopaḥ' and we shall study this further, later on. In studying these sūtras and this small section we will also study a particular method of making the meaning of a sūtra in the Aṣṭādhyāyī. So, we will follow certain method. This method involves the following steps.

First of all we ask a question namely, what are the exact words used in the sūtra? First of all let us figure out the exact words, because in the sūtra, there are words uttered with closed proximity result in resulting in euphonic combinations. So, first of all we need to dissolve all those combinations and get the exact word that is used in the sūtra so as to remove any ambiguity that is possible.

Then the next question we ask is this is the next step, what are the cases which are parts of the words that are figured that are used? After we assign the cases, after we identify the cases used

then we go find out the meaning of these cases. So, the question we ask is what is the meaning of these cases?

After we are done with this then we go to the next step by asking the next question namely, are there any words which are continued from previous sūtra or sūtras in this sūtra to complete the sentence in this particular sūtra? Then we find that out and several times the commentators help us, sometimes the tradition helps us, tradition of teachers after we are done with this we look at the next question, are there metarules which apply in this sūtra?

And then we find that out and if there are any meta rule rules that apply in this particular sūtra, we do apply them and the answers to all these questions put together, they give us a certain methodology to make the meaning of one particular sūtra and we shall see how this happens when we study this section small section of 'it saṁjñā', the term 'it' which we used earlier in forming the pratyāhāra and there in brief we used 1.3.3 which said that the final consonant is termed as 'it', in all the 14 sūtras the final consonant is termed as 'it'. This is what we have studied earlier in brief. Let us study this in detail hereafter.

So, let us take the first sūtra in this section 1.3.2, what is the sūtra? The sūtra is 'upadeśe'janunāsika it'. Let us go step by step as noted down earlier. The first step is to identify the exact words in the sūtra by removing the euphonic combinations. So, we have the following. There are 4 words in this sūtra. They are 'upadeśe', 'ac', 'anunāsikaḥ' and 'it'. This is what these exact words are. Then we go to the next step namely identify the cases these words have.

So, 'upadeśe' is 7th case, 7 slash 1. 'Ac' is in the first case, 1 slash 1. 'Anunāsikaḥ' again in the first case 1 slash 1 and 'it' once again the first case that is 1 slash 1. So, we note that there are three words appearing in the first case and the even the number 1 slash 1.

So, the cases of all these three words match, that is good enough a reason to think of a possible relation between them and we shall see how it develops. 'Upadeśe' needs to be studied closely, because in this case the 7th case does not mean what we have seen before, immediately before, no! that is why we said that those meanings in the meta-language they are additional in addition to the meanings that are available in the object language.

Here in 'upadeśe', the 7 th case means the same thing as it would mean in the object language namely 'in' or 'on'. So, 'upadeśe' means in the 'upadeśa', in the 'upadeśa'. 'Ac', we have already seen what 'ac' stands for and the answer is a vowel or any vowel. So, 'ac' stands for vowels and then finally, 'anunāsikaḥ', 'anunāsika' is a technical term defined by Pāṇini in 1.1.8 in general, we can

translate 'anunāsika' by the word nasal and of course, 'it' is the technical term that is defined. So, the other words define the term 'it' and 'it' is the technical term over here.

So, the term 'it' gets defined by these three words 'upadeśe', 'anunāsikaḥ' and 'ac'. So, we say that 'upadeśe' means in the 'upadeśa'. This meaning of the 7 th case is found in the object language. This instance is not to be interpreted as per the meta rule explained earlier. This does not mean immediately before the 'upadeśa', no! it means in the 'upadeśa' as is the case in the object language.

So, the next question is what is an 'upadeśa'? An 'upadeśa' is explained as 'ādyoccāraṇam', 'ādya uccāraṇam'; 'ādya' is initial, 'uccāraṇa' is enunciation. So, 'ādya uccāraṇam' means initial enunciation. So, 'upadeśa' is initial enunciation of elements for the purpose of deriving the sentences of Sanskrit.

What it means is placing the basic material required for the beginning of the grammatical derivation process on table, all this includes lexicon which is tagged and we shall see how it gets tagged more specifically about the term 'it' and so on and grammar rules that is what is part of the 'upadeśa', the lexicon as well as grammar rules.

What it does not include is the following. 'Upadeśa' does not include the substitute that replaces the substituent after the application of the grammatical rule, this is not 'upadeśa'. 'Upadeśa' is the stage where all the elements are placed side by side before you actually begin the grammatical process and in Pāṇinian grammar the grammatical process is in the form of in many cases, substitution, 'x' is substituted by 'y', we have seen this example and this kind of explanation before.

Here is a concrete example. So, in the list of verbal roots you find 'ci' as mentioned here and in the list of suffixes you find 'yat'. So, now, you can say that they are part of the original or initial enunciation. Now by applying a rule 'ci' becomes 'ce' and 'yat' becomes 'ya'. Now this stage is the stage of substitution. So, 'ce' is a substitute, 'ya' can be called a substitute, but let us keep 'ya' aside let us focus on 'ce' right now, 'ce' can be a substitute and 'ce' will not be or is not part of the initial enunciation. This is the substitution.

So, for example, we begin the process by looking at the meaning to collect and then in order to express this meaning we look at the verbal roots. This is the most suitable candidate. We pick it up and we bring it to the table. We start the derivation process now. So, after this 'ci' we add the suffix 'yat' and then after this 'yat' gets added, the 't' at the end gets the 'itsamjñā' by the application of 1.3.3 and then this 't' gets deleted.

And then we go to the next step where 'ci' becomes 'ce' and 'ya' remains as it is and then finally, you will get the form 'ceya'. In this form 'ceya', the starting point is 'ci' and then 'yat' which is added. So, this is the initial enunciation stage, 'ci' plus 'yat'. The rest is the substitution where elements get substituted one by another. This is what is 'upadeśa'.

Now, let us come back to the other words and their meanings in the sūtra, 'ac', 'anunāsika' and 'it', we have seen what 'ac' means, we have seen what 'anunāsika' means, 'ac' is a vowel, 'anunāsika' is a nasal vowel or nasal and all these three words they have 1 slash 1 as the case, we have noted this. This indicates that they are interrelated and what kind of interrelation is this. The answer is 'samjñā-samjñī-bhāva', that one of them is a technical term and rest is the definition or the description of this technical term and we know that 'it' is that technical term whereas 'ac' and 'anunāsika' define this technical term 'it'. 'Anunāsika' which means nasal which is defined by 1.1.8 will give us now the following meaning. 'Anunāsika' is that sound that is produced from both oral as well as nasal cavity. Now, after having known what 'anunāsika' is and what 'ac' is, now we can define what is an 'it', the first definition.

The first definition is in the 'upadeśa' that is initial enunciation, this feature of the sound which is nasality is used for the meta-linguistic function, in the written as well as in oral text; however, this feature is not explicitly displayed in all the editions or in the manuscripts;

however, the meta rules will clearly state which element is nasal the meta rules come to our help; so now the meaning of 1.3.2 is the following 'upadeśe anunāsikaḥ ac itsamjñaḥ syāt'. What it means is in the initial enunciation a nasal vowel is termed 'it', once again this feature of nasality of a vowel is not explicitly displayed by any separate symbol in all the editions some editions try to give some symbol, but that is not what is followed everywhere. In fact, in most of the texts that we see this practice is not followed. So, then how do we know and even in the oral tradition this practice is not followed then how do we know which element is nasal. So, the Pāṇinian grammatical tradition has observed which vowels are considered as nasal. And accordingly they have noted them down in specific statements. These statements come to our rescue and then they tell us which element is to be termed as 'it' which vowel is termed as 'it'. So, a vowel is stated to be nasal by a given statement and then by applying this rule such a vowel is termed 'it'.

Let us take an example, a concrete example, this example is 'edha vṛddhau'. This is taken from the Dhātupāṭha which is a list of verbal roots. What it means is 'edha' is the verbal root and 'vṛddhau' is the meaning in which it is used by the speakers in the object language.

What this means is in the sense of increase the verbal root 'edha' is used that is the general meaning of this line.

If we look at 'edha', we observe that there are 2 vowels one at the beginning 'e' and second 'a' at the end after this 'dh'. So, there are 3 sounds involved here, 'e', 'dh' and 'a', amongst them 'a' at the end of 'edha' is termed to have nasal feature by the tradition. It is stated to have the nasal feature. So, this 'a' is nasal here, this 'a' is nasal as per the statement in the tradition, as per the statement in the Dhātupāṭha. So, this 'a' is now called 'anunāsika' and therefore, it is now termed 'it' by 1.3.2. And then it is immediately deleted by 1.3.9. This vowel is now used as a marker to trigger certain operations like the subset of suffixes to be added after this verbal root that is what is triggered by this 'a' which is nasal.

Let us take another example. This is what we have already seen, the 5 the the 2 sūtras out of the 14 sūtras that we studied at the beginning they are 'hayavaraṭ' and 'laṇ'. Now in this in these two sūtras we have seen that 1.3.3 applies and 'ṭ' and 'ṇ', they become 'it'. What is the use of 1.3.2 here?

What we say is 'a' at the end of the 6th sūtra 'laṇ' and 'l' in it. So, 'a' at the end of 'l' in 'laṇ' the 6th sūtra is termed as nasal by the oral tradition of the Pāṇinian grammar and therefore, it is termed as 'it' and by A 1.3.2 it is termed as as 'it' and is deleted immediately by 1.3.9.

Now by joining this nasal 'anunāsika' and hence 'it a' with the previous 'r' consonant which appears in the 5th 'sūtra' over here. By the technique of making the 'pratyāhāra', the Pāṇnian grammar derives the 'ra' to describe operations with respect to the sounds 'r' and 'l'. These two consonants are part of the 'pratyāhāra' in which 'a' as a vowel is marked as 'it', because it is stated to possess the feature of nasality.

So, this is the second example where a vowel is termed as 'it'.

So, what are our observations? In the list of verbal roots, the 'it' is coupled with other feature namely accent and then the verbal root is called having a particular accent as 'it' for example, 'anudātta' and 'it'. So, the verbal root is termed as 'anudāttet' a verbal root having an 'anudātta it'. 'Anudātta' is a kind of accent, we shall deal with this later on. In case of 'edha' it is termed as 'anudāttet' whereby it means that the vowel 'a' which is 'anudātta' and 'anunāsika' is 'it'. And now A 1.3.13 uses this feature and states that 'ātmanepada' suffixes are added after a verbal root which is 'anudāttet'. So, this is how this 'anunāsika it' will be used to trigger this kind of operation.

To summarize we studied one sūtra 1.3.2 and now we say that this is the only sūtra stating the term 'it' to a vowel and this vowel essentially should be nasal and how do we determine whether it is a nasal or not? This we determine by convention. So, the nasality is a conventional feature stated by actual statements in the Pāṇinian grammar.

So, this 'it' vowel is actually not part of the oral as well as written transmission related to that vowel. The tradition has observed and noted down such nasal words. After having seen this sūtra which terms the vowel as 'it' what next is the next question and the next point is the consonants which are termed as 'it' and this is stated between the section 1.3.3 and 1.3. 8. We shall study this next.

Thank you.