

Course Name: 'Introduction to Pāṇinian Grammar'
Professor Name: Prof. Malhar Arvind Kulkarni
Department Name: Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS)
Institute Name: IIT Bombay
Week:02
Lecture:10

Welcome. I welcome you all to this lecture in the course 'Introduction to Pāṇinian grammar'. In the course so far, we have been studying the features of the Meta-language of Pāṇini and we noted that there are three important features which differentiate the Meta-language of Pāṇini from the object language Sanskrit and these three differences are the meaning of a word, the meaning of the cases and the technique of 'pratyāhāra'.

Before this, we have also seen with examples how object language and Meta-language are different in case of some grammars and how they are same in case of some other grammars. We noted that in case of Pāṇinian grammar, the object language is Sanskrit and the Meta-language is also Sanskrit and these are the differences between those two.

It must be clarified here that these differences are some additional differences, what I mean is that there are some features of the object language that are also used in the Meta-language, but these are the additional features and we shall explain this little later. Right now, we have already seen the first difference, we have already explained it with some examples and we are studying currently the second difference namely the meaning of the cases. In this so far, we have also seen the meanings of the cases in the object language. We also saw what do we mean by a case? We took concrete examples to illustrate this fact wherein we studied the independent world forms in the cases and we also looked at the sentence examples in which these forms are used.

Now in today's lecture, we shall be focused on the meaning of the cases in the Meta-language of Pāṇinian grammar. So, how they are different! To take a recap, the basic principle is the first difference between the object language and the Meta-language and this difference is very fundamental. This principle says that a word stands for its own form and this own form is the head; it also conveys the meaning-meaning and this meaning-meaning is subordinate and the own form of the word is the head, the only exception is in case of the technical grammatical terms. In accordance with this principle, now the meaning of the cases should be understood in the Meta-language of Pāṇinian grammar. To highlight this particular aspect, let us take a relook at the diagrammatic explanation of this basic principle.

Here, in the Meta-language, a word 'śabda', let us say 'agni', when uttered conveys this meaning. So, we say that the word 'agni' denotes this meaning. This meaning consists of what is popularly known as meaning which is shown here and this meaning consists of two aspects; one is a

universal property and the other one is an individual, 'agnitva' is that property and 'agni' is that individual; these are the meaning-meanings and this meaning also includes the word form, 'agni', 'a', 'g', 'n', 'i', the sequence. And in the Meta-language, it is this aspect which is part of the meaning which is predominant which is head and it is this aspect of meaning-meaning which acts as subordinate or qualifier or modifier. This very basic fact also helps us grasp the difference in the meanings of the cases used in the Meta-language.

We already saw that there are three cases which need to be studied closely from this point of view and the first amongst them is the 5th case and the rest are the 6th and the 7th. So, now we shall study the meaning of these three cases; the 5th, the 6th and the 7th; 'pañcamī', 'ṣaṣṭhī' and 'saptamī-vibhakti' and their meanings in the Meta-language.

Let us take the first amongst these three which is the 5th case. The meaning of the 5th case in the Meta-language of Pāṇini is 'immediately after', 'Avyavahitapara', 'immediately after', of course, immediately after a word form, 'Avyavahitapara'. This is explained by the sūtra 'tasmād ityuttarasya' which is a Meta rule Aṣṭādhyāyī 1.1.67. So, there are three words in this sūtra, 'tasmād', 'iti', and 'uttarasya'. And 'tasmād iti' represent something. What does it represent? 'tasmād' is the 5th case of the pronoun 'tad'. So, 'tasmād' stands for as a representative, the 5th case. Therefore, this 'iti' which is a portative marker, this brings out the meaning that we specified just now. So, 'tasmād iti' refers to the mention of the 5th case 'pañcamī' and then, what it stands for is 'uttara' that is after. And this after according to that tradition is not just anything after, but it is immediately after. So, what this sūtra in a nutshell stands for is when a word is mentioned using the 5th case in the Meta-language, it means immediately after that word, immediately after that word.

Let us then look at the meaning of the 6th case and we are going to take examples to illustrate all these points little later in this lecture. Let us first of all look at the meaning of the 6th case now in the Meta-language of Pāṇini. The meaning of the 6th case in the Meta-language of Pāṇini is in place of, in place of or instead of and the word used for this is 'sthāne'; this is also used in the text of Aṣṭādhyāyī, 'sthāne' and what is 'sthāna'? 'Sthāne' is the locative place of 'sthāna'. What is 'sthāna'? 'Sthāna' is translated as 'prasaṅga, an occasion for a meaning to be thought out for an expression, okay! That is what is 'sthāna'. And this will become clear, when we study the process of speech production according to Pāṇinian grammar.

Now, this particular 'sthāna' which is a meaning, an occasion for a meaning to be thought out for an expression gets later on converted into directly audible speech and we shall study this later on, when we study the process of speech production as described in the Pāṇinian grammar.

The Meta rule which describes this particular feature, this particular meaning is this, 'ṣaṣṭhī sthāneyogā', Aṣṭādhyāyī 1.1.49. 'ṣaṣṭhī' here stands for the 6th case. 'Sthāne' means in place and 'yogā' referred to the meaning associated. So, what this 'sūtra' means is that the 6th case is associated with in place. What is what it stands for or means is that a word mention using the 6th case means in place of that word and I repeat, a word mention using 6th case attached to it means in place of that word.

Similarly, let us look at the meaning of the 7th case in the Meta-language of Pāṇini. The 7th case in the Meta-language of Pāṇini means 'immediately before', 'avyavahitapūrva', immediately before a word and the sūtra, the Meta rule which prescribes this is Aṣṭādhyāyī 1.1.66, 'tasmin iti nirdiṣṭe pūrvasya'. Once again, 'tasmin iti' refers to the 7th case in the same fashion as 'tasmād iti'. 'Nirdiṣṭe' means when mentioned. 'Pūrvasya' means of before. Now, the tradition explains that this 'of before' is not just any thing of before, but it is immediately before. So, what this 'sūtra' literally means is when a word is mentioned using the 7th case in the Meta-language, it means immediately before that word. This occurrence means immediately before that word, 'tasmin iti nirdiṣṭe pūrvasya'.

Now, let us look at the examples. Before proceeding to study the examples which explain the meanings of that these three cases, it is important also to remember this difference. In the object language, the 5th case is translated using the word 'from', now in the Meta-language, the 5th case is translated as 'immediately after'. In the object language, the 6th case is translated using the word 'of', in the Meta-language, the 6th case is translated as 'in place of' or 'instead of'. In the object language, the 7th case is translated with the help of the word 'in or on' and in the Meta-language, it is translated as 'immediately before'. This is the difference.

Now, let us look at the examples which illustrate these meanings of these cases in the Meta-language. First, let us take the examples of the 5th case in the Meta-language and this is the first example and we have already seen this when we explain the first difference between the object language and the Meta-language. Here is a sūtra 'agnerḍhak', Aṣṭādhyāyī 4.2.33. Word 'agner' is the 5th case of the word 'agni'. It is 5 slash 1 of 'agni'. Therefore, it means immediately after the word 'agni'. So, 'agner' stands for immediately after the word form 'agni'. So, what this sūtra in all stands for is that add suffix 'ḍhak' immediately after the word form 'agni', in the sense that is the deity, in the sense of that is the deity, add this suffix 'ḍhak' to the word form 'agni'. So, 'āgneya' is the derived form over here. 'Āgneya' is something which is offered to deity 'agni', something that is offered to 'agni' as a deity is called 'āgneya' and here is the derivation process.

We have seen this before. 'Agni' is the word to which is added the suffix 'ḍhak' in accordance with 4.2.33. Then, this 'ḍhak' gets substituted by 'eya' by 7.1.2, then this 'agni' becomes 'āgni' by

7.2.118 and then this 'āgni' becomes 'āgn' by 6.4.148 and finally, you get the form 'āgneya', okay! Now here the 5th case stands for immediately after a word, word form.

This is an explanation. A grammatical operation is stated with reference to an element already stated or already known and this element will appear on the left-hand side as is the case here. 'Agni' is the element with which this derivation starts. So, this becomes the left-hand side environment. The newly stated element will appear on the right-hand side and 'ḍhak' is newly stated. It was absent here. Now, it is stated. This is stated on the right-hand side. So, eventually, what it means is that the word mentioned using the 5th case works as a left-hand side environment or the condition for the rule to apply. So, 4.2.33 takes 'agni' as the left-hand side element and adds the suffix 'ḍhak' to the word form 'agni' and therefore, immediately after explains this better, that is the meaning of the 5th case in the Meta-language.

Let us take the second example of the 5th case and its meaning. Here is a sūtra, another sūtra, 'ata iña', 'ata iña', the word 'ata' stands in the 5th case, 5 slash 1 and there is one more word which is continued from the previous sūtra, 'prātipadikāt', that is also 5 slash 1 and both these words in the 5th case, they mean something same, they refer to something same. So now, the 5 slash 1 which is the 5 slash 1 of 'at' meaning short 'a' and 'prātipadikāt' is the 5 slash 1 of 'prātipadika'. Now, both of them put together will give us the meaning a nominal root ending in short 'a'. This is also brought about by another Meta rule which we will study later. All these put together now, the meaning of this sūtra is that immediately after a 'prātipadika' which ends in short 'a', add 'iña' in the sense of it's descendent. We shall study closely how to make the meaning of a sūtra, using various devices, words continued from the previous sūtra etcetera, that we shall do later on. Right now, let us focus on the meaning of the 5th case in the sūtras and in this particular sūtra, 'ataḥ' which is in 5/1, 'prātipadikāt' which is also in 5/1, they give us this meaning immediately after a 'prātipadika' which ends in short 'a', add 'iña' and here is an example.

So, the meaning available to us is 'Daśarathasya apatyam'. This is an input. 'Apatyam' means a descendent. So, the descendant of Dasaratha. This is the meaning that we want to convey and now, we have the 'prātipadika', 'Daśaratha' which ends in short 'a' and in the sense of 'apatya' or its descendant, the rule 4.1.95 gets applied and we will add the suffix 'iña' to the 'prātipadika' which ends in short 'a' namely 'Daśaratha';

so we have 'Daśaratha' plus 'iña' after which 1.3.3 and 1.3.8 get applied and so we get 'Daśaratha' plus 'i', then we get 'Dāśaratha' plus 'i' by 7.2.115, then we get 'Dāśarath' plus 'i' by 6.4.148 and so we get the form 'Dāśarathi'. The explanation of this is the following. A grammatical operation is stated with reference to an element which is already known or stated.

In this case, it is the word 'Daśaratha' which is already known or stated which will stand to explain and express this particular meaning. Now this element 'Daśaratha' will appear on the left-hand side and the newly stated element which is 'iña' that will appear on the right hand side.

Now, the word mentioned using the 5th case, in this case, it is 'ataḥ' and 'prātipadikāt', in this case 'Daśaratha'. So, this will work as the left-hand side element or environment for the rule 4.1.95 to apply and we will get the final resultant form 'Dāśarathi', the descendant of 'Daśaratha'.

Let us take the third example which explains the meaning of the 5th case in the Meta-language of Pāṇini and the meaning of the 5th case is 'immediately after'. Here is another example. The sūtra is 'aco yat'. 'Aco' is 5/1 of 'ac', a vowel, 'yat' is also there and we also have 'dhātoḥ', continuing from the previous sūtra. 'Dhātoḥ' is also in 5/1, it is the 5/1 of 'dhātu'.

Now, the sūtra 'aco yat' which is 3.1.97 means immediately after a verbal root. So, immediately after a verbal root which ends in a vowel, ending in a vowel, 'aco dhātoḥ', immediately after a verbal root ending in a vowel, add suffix 'yat' in the sense of 'bhāva' and 'karma'. So, here is the verbal root 'ci', meaning to collect, this ends in a vowel 'i', so immediately after this 'dhātu' which ends in a vowel 'i', we add the suffix 'yat'.

Then, by applying 1.3.3 and 8, we get 'ci' plus 'ya' as a next stage in the derivation. Then, we get 'ci' becomes 'ce' and plus 'ya' as the next step of derivation, where we apply 7.3.84, so we get the form 'ceya', meaning something to be collected. The explanation of this is as follows. A grammatical operation is stated with reference to an element already stated.

So, adding the suffix 'yat' is the grammatical operation over here. In the earlier case, adding the suffix 'iña' was the grammatical operation. So, this operation of adding the suffix 'yat' is stated with reference to an element which is already known or stated; in this case, it is the verbal root 'ci' meaning to collect. This element will appear on the left-hand side as is shown.

Now, the newly stated element which is 'yat' which will appear on the right-hand side as you see here. So, in a nutshell, the word mentioned using 5th case works as a left-hand side environment of condition for the rule to apply, which is quite visible over here. So, the word that appears in the left hand, in the 5th case appears as the left-hand side environment for the element to be added that is 'yat' over here and this goes undergoes the further processing and we get the output namely 'ceya', something to be collected. These are the examples in which the 5th case is used in the Meta-language of Pāṇini to mean immediately after and this is how the sūtra's meanings are made.

Now, let us go and study the meaning of the 6th case with the help of the examples and here is the first example. 'Aster bhūḥ', this is 2.4.52 in which 'asteḥ' appears in 6/1 of 'asti', 'asti' refers to a verbal root 'as', 'as' to mean, 'as' means to exist. Now, what 'asteḥ' stands for is in place of 'as', the root 'as'. So, what the sūtra means here is that place 'bhū' in place of 'as', substitute 'bhū' in place of 'as', that is the meaning of the sūtra in a particular environment called 'ārdhadhātuka'.

So, here is the the example 'as' and then, we add the suffix 'ta' which is an 'ārdhadhātuka' by 3.2.102 over here and then, we replace this 'as' by bhū. We substitute 'bhū' in place of 'as' in the environment of 'ta' which is an 'ārdhadhātuka' and we shall see what is an 'ārdhadhātuka', when we study the technical terms in the 'Aṣṭādhyāyī'. So, 'bhū' substitutes 'as' and so, we get the final resultant form 'bhūta', one which existed that is the meaning, one which existed.

The explanation is as follows. So, 'bhūḥ' is 1 slash 1 in the combination with 6 slash 1 as stated before. This 1 slash 1 denotes a substitute and 'as' is the substituent, 'ta' is the environment. In the environment of 'ta', 'as' is substituted by 'bhū'. In other words, 'bhū' replaces 'as' as shown earlier.

Now, let us look at the second example in which the meaning of the 6th case is explained further. The example is 'iko yaṇ aci' 6.1.77. In this sūtra, 'ikaḥ' is in 6th case, 6 slash 1. What it means is in place of 'ik', 'aci' is in the 7th case, 7 slash 1 of 'ac'. 'Ac' means a vowel and how 'ac' means a vowel, we are going to study this in a while.

So, now what 'aci' means is immediately before a vowel and what 'ikaḥ' means is in place of 'ik'. So, what this sūtra means is immediately before a vowel and 'ik' is substituted by 'yaṇ'. That means, if you have a condition or situation where 'ik' plus 'ac' occurs, then the output of this by applying 6.1.77 would be 'yaṇ' plus 'ac'. 'Yaṇ' substituted substitutes 'ik'. 'Yaṇ' replaces 'ik' in the environment of 'ac'.

The explanation of the first case in combination with the 6th case over here is the following. 'Yaṇ' is 1 slash 1 in combination with 6 slash 1 as is stated before, it denotes a substitute. 'Ik' is the substituent. 'Ac' is the environment. So, in the environment of 'ac', 'ik' is substituted by 'yaṇ'. In other words, 'yaṇ' replaces 'ik'. This is how 'in place of' is the meaning of 6th case in this sūtra, 'iko yaṇ aci'.

Let us look at one more example of the 6th case and its meaning as in place of. The example is 'jhalām jaś jhaśi', where 'jhalām' appears in 6th case, 6 slash 3. 'Jaś' appears in first case, 1 slash 1. 'Jhaśi' appears in 7th case, 7 slash 1. This is 8.4.53. 'Jhalām' is the 6th case of 'jhal', 'jhaśi' is

the 7th case of 'jhaś' and what these two terms mean, we will be studying in a while. But let us concentrate on the meanings of the cases.

Suppose, some meaning of 'jhal' is known to us, even if we do not know the meaning of 'jhaś', with the help of the meaning of the cases, we can still make the general meaning of the sūtra available to us. What that general meaning of the sūtra would be is this. Immediately before 'jhaś' substitute 'jhal' by 'jaś'. To put it in the form of an equation, we can say that when 'jhal' plus 'jhaś', this situation arises, in this situation, the output after having applied 8.4.53 would be 'jaś' plus 'jhaś'.

Here, 'jaś' is replacing 'jhal'. The explanation is this. 'Jaś' appears in 1 slash 1, in combination with 6 slash 1 as stated before, it denotes a substitute. 'Jhal' is that substituent. So, 'jhaś' is the environment and in the environment of 'jhaś', 'jhal' is substituted by 'jaś'. In other words, 'jaś' replaces 'jhal'.

This is the explanation of the first case and its meaning in combination with the 6th case. So, these are the examples which show the use of the 6th case in the Meta-language and its meaning namely 'in place of'. We can explain this further by saying that the methodology used in Pāṇinian grammar is that of substitution. What it means is given a meaning condition and additional verbal conditions, 'X' verbal element is substituted by 'Y' verbal element; 'X' acts as the substituend and 'Y' is the substitute.

In all these cases, 6th case may also mean 'instead of' when we refer to the internal processing of all these elements. When we say internal, what we mean is at the intellectual level. This we shall discuss ahead, when we study the process of speech production.

So, what we say is that in the environment of 'ta' instead of 'as', 'bhū' is placed. In the environment of 'ac' in case of 'iko yaṇ aci', 'ik' is substituted in place of 'yaṇ'. That means, instead of 'ik', 'yaṇ' is placed and in the case of the third example, 'jhalām jaś jhaśi', we can say that in the environment of 'jhaś', 'jhal' is substituted meaning thereby that in the environment of 'jhaś', instead of 'jhal', 'jaś' is placed.

So, this is the explanation of the use of the 6th case and its meaning in the Meta-language of Pāṇini. Now, we shall study the meaning of the 7th case in the Meta-language of Pāṇini in the next lecture.

To summarize what we have said so far, we stated the meanings of 5th case and the 6th case in the object language previously and in this lecture, we studied the meanings of these two cases in the Meta-language. The meaning of the 5th case in the Meta-languages immediately after and the meaning of the 6th case in the Meta-language is 'in place of' or 'instead of' and we studied this with the help of three examples each. Now, we shall study the meaning of the 7th case in the next lecture and continue the topic further and also the third difference in the object language and the Meta-language namely the technique of 'pratyāhāra'.

So now, before we end this lecture, let us look at the 'maṅgalācaraṇa' as is our practice and also, the 5 sūtras. This 'maṅgalācaraṇa' is taken from the text called 'Padamañjarī', a commentary on the 'Nyāsa' as well as the 'Kāśikāvṛtti' mentioned earlier. I will read the 'maṅgalācaraṇa' "yaścīrāya haradattasamjñayā viśruto daśasu dikṣu dakṣiṇaḥ, ujjahāra padamañjarīmasau śabdaśāstrasahakārapādapāt ". I will repeat, "yaścīrāya haradattasamjñayā viśruto daśasu dikṣu dakṣiṇaḥ, ujjahāra padamañjarīmasau śabdaśāstrasahakārapādapāt ". And the next 5 sūtras, these are from second chapter, first pāda and the first 5 sūtras. They are as follows, 'samarthaḥ padavidhiḥ', 'subāmantrite parāṅgavat svare', 'prākkaḍārāt samāsaḥ', 'saha supā', 'avyayībhāvaḥ'. I will repeat, 'samarthaḥ padavidhiḥ', 'subāmantrite parāṅgavat svare', 'prākkaḍārāt samāsaḥ', 'saha supā' and 'avyayībhāvaḥ'.

Thank you.